MIAMI-DADE COUNTY COMMUNITY RELATIONS BOARD
GENERAL MEMBERSHIP MEETING REPORT
March 20, 2013, 2:00 p.m.
Stephen P. Clark Government Center, 111 NW 1st Street, Miami, FL 33128
Conference Room 18-4

Attendance:
CRB Members: See Roll Call attached
CRB Staff: Amy Carswell, Edward Harris
Guests: Lori Weldon, Miami-Dade RER; Darren McQueen, MDPD; Robert Garland, MDPD; Same Gilmore, CSBE Board; Winifred Brown, ECO Solution Group, LLC.

The CRB General Membership Meeting was called to order by the vice chair, Reinaldo Valdes.

The Roll Call was taken. Fourteen members were present. A quorum was not achieved.

Rabbi Schiff and George Yap noted they were marked absent on the minutes from the last meeting but were present and asked that the minutes be corrected.

1. Special Presentations and Discussion

- **Miami-Dade County Study of Disparities in Small and Minority Business Contracting**

Mr. Valdes stated that Miami-Dade County has contracted with Mason Tillman Associates, Ltd., for a Disparity Study of Small and Minority Business Contracting. He introduced Calonie Gray, Director of Operations and Sandra Williams, Director of Procurement and Development, from Q-Q Research Consultants who were conducting the local research.

Presentations: Sandra Williams reported that Mason Tillman is the prime contractor for Miami-Dade County Disparity Study. Mason Tillman has operated for 34 years and a nationally recognized expert in this field; conducting 117 studies. QQ Research Consultants is the local sub-contractor working with Mason Tillman providing research and evaluation. QQ is a minority women owned business located in Miami-Dade County performing research and evaluation services and data analysis. QQ will conduct antidotal interviews; qualitative analysis, and private sector analysis. The goal is to determine if statistical disparity exists, to ascertain practices affecting documentation disparity, to access effectiveness of race and gender neutral programs, and to prepare a legally defensible study. Challenges are outreach to ethnically diverse community; to identify prime and subcontract awards and payments; to recommend best management practices to eliminate barriers. Study will use the Croson Standard to ensure compelling evidence of systematic racial discrimination and if any discrimination is found the county must have narrowly tailored remedy to address the discrimination and must periodically access the effectiveness of the remedy.

Calonie Gray reported that the contractor will look at the Dept. of Public Works & Waste Management and the Dept. of Water and Sewer. The study will consider construction, A&E, other professional services, and other goods and services, between 1/1/2006 and 12/31/2011. Phase 1 is complete and work plans have been approved by the County. The study is now in Phase 2. We want to collect prime and sub-contract records; to look at businesses that applied for awards; the award; the capacity of business; to determine how many willing and able businesses are in the County that could have applied for a contract. The study will collect information and analyze prime and sub-contractor utilization to determine whether or not there was a statically significant difference in contracts awarded, minority or women vs. not. Anecdotal accounts of business will be collected. The study will make recommendations to eliminate barriers to contracting if discrimination was found. The CRB is asked to participate in upcoming community meetings; to encourage business owners and senior managers to participate; to facilitate access to contract records and staff; and to recommend business owners and former employees for anecdotal interviews. A link to business survey can be found at - https://www.surveymonkey.com/s/miami-dadebusinesssurvey

Discussion: Mr. Valdes opened the discussion for questions and answers as follows:

- A CRB member asked: What areas will be targeted and what will be the goal of the focus groups? Ms. Gray responded that this is a Countywide study, not just one segment of the population. Focus Groups were held north, south and central Dade that were open to everyone. The survey monkey open to all business owners
- A CRB member asked: Why were those two departments selected and not others that could have had many more RFPs, such as GSA? Ms. Gray responded that it has been recognized that the selected departments had small utilization in terms of minority businesses because they generally had large contracts that could price out small business. A previous study was done in 2004-05 looking to evaluate whether the County had proper data systems in place for data collection to determine if a disparity study could be done and recommended that certain data systems should be put in place. The two departments which most rigorously adhered to those data collection procedures were the two selected for this study and they had all the data collection methods available to conduct the disparity study. Commissioner Edmonson was looking to see if data could be generated or recreated and retrospectively to go back and see if other disparity existed.
- A CRB member asked: What is timeframe for study completion? Ms. Gray responded that the contractor is a little behind but trying to catch up.
- A CRB member asked: Commissioner Edmonson took the reins with the selection of departments to be studied and was going to hire Marsh Jack man who identified a way to go back and be more comprehensive. When will we know if this will happen? Ms. Gray responded that the question will need to be referred back to find the prime contractor.
- A CRB member commented: I am concerned that no matter what the outcome of this study, it would not show true light of what was happening in this County

and would hurt us more than help us, since it would be a legal document. CRB could assist in dispersing this information. Whatever Commissioner Edmonson decides, it is important to ensure that the community hears the answer. Ms. Gray responded that if no disparity is found, how can you continue to generate future disparity studies that look at other departments? This concern has been raised at each of the three community meetings.

- A guest commented that: Commissioner Jordan directed the Aviation and Seaport Departments to collect data but they failed to comply. This is why the data was not available. Marsha Jack man was trying to put data together. It might be best to back off, if you don't have the right data to proceed, rather than having a disparity study that shows no disparity.
- A CRB member commented that perhaps the CRB should intercede or assist.
- A CRB member commented that the CRB has looked at this issue through its Housing and Economic Issues Committee. Since minority records were not kept by the County or sub-contractors, a disparity study is being conducted. There are a lot of questions that are unanswered.
- A CRB member commented: Shouldn't the County already have the records. Monies awarded through grants or other means must have the necessary information. Record keeping must be in place. Cannot believe the County does not have records. There is an in-house problem. There must be transparency.
- A CRB member commented: The Beacon Council deals with large businesses, not the small companies. I give them money through the County but they do not get help to small businesses.
- A CRB member commented: the Metro-Miami Action Plan, which is now the Miami-Dade Economic Advocacy Trust, funded many small businesses. We do not have this now and we have no expectations from the Beacon Council. The Flight line company was a minority firm operating at Opa-locka Airport that needed support. Ms. Gray responded: We would love to interview those business owners that have dissolved.
- A CRB member asked if the county's Living Wage Ordinance and Wage Theft Law fit into disparities being looked for? Ms. Gray responded: Yes, especially as it relates to sub-contractors.
- A CRB member asked: Is race incorporated and how is race defined? Ms. Gray responded: Race is defined based upon US Census guidelines. Look at broad categories; Asian, Native American, Black, Hispanic, White Non-Hispanic.
- A CRB member asked: The Community Action Agency Board Section 3 law requires that neighborhood people are to be hired when a government contract is given but this is not enforced. Are you looking into this? Ms Gray responded: Yes, it is incorporated into the study.
- A CRB member commented: The County Manager did not implement recommended reforms and that was why department directors did not implement the reforms. Hopefully, the strong Mayor will get this done. Commissioners Edmonson and Jordan have fought for a long time and finally we are getting something done. There has been a process of foot dragging and intentional non collection of data.

- A CRB member commented: Even if we do not use gender or minority owned businesses for guideline purposes, we should request that data to secure fair and equitable dispensation of County contracts. I want to know who we are giving 30 percent to...
- A CRB member asked: Would it be best to hold off on the disparity study, since we do not have the proper data?
- A CRB member commented that: The contractors are here for our help and recommendations. We can do something about it. The Black Affairs Advisory Board and the CRB needs to make sure that people come forward and be interviewed by Q&Q Research. The CRB needs to ensure we do something in the midst of this study and make recommendations.
- A CRB member commented: The Disparity Study is moving forward and we cannot prevent it. They are here to give us information about it and we can assist with providing additional documentation. The Community was not informed in a timely manner. We can have more meetings in less benefited areas where small contractors are that cannot get a bond, insurance or six months to get County Vendor Certification, or the $50,000 fee.
- A CRB member commented: The Black Affairs Advisory Board will work with the CRB to help locate names to be interviewed.
- A guest commented: It is important to understand that there are cities across the country that do not have black enterprise business programs who have 35-40 percent black participation. Blacks are less than 1 percent of the contracts; yet, 23 percent of the population. To go from 1 to 23 percent does not take laws or ordinances; it takes the will of Mayor and County Commissioners.

Proposed Actions:
The following actions were proposed but not voted upon:
That the CRB recommend to the Board of County Commissioners and the Mayor via a letter that there is a need to encourage better community participation in the Disparity Study that additional community meetings be held, with sufficient advance notice and at locations throughout the county and at a variety of times.

That the CRB support the Disparity Study process by: encouraging additional attendance at the community meetings; and recommend individuals and/or entities to be included in the process and interviewed.

- **Miami-Dade Responsible Wages Ordinance**

Rabbi Solomon Schiff, spoke on behalf of Jobs With Justice. Passover celebrates the exodus from Egypt. The story is about the importance of freedom. Passover and Easter have the same theme. The Interfaith Workers Justice group helped to pass several good amendments that helped workers; however, a State legislator has introduced legislation to eliminate the Miami-Dade County living wage and wage theft ordinances. I arranged a meeting with the Archbishop and Jeanette Smith, Executive Director of South Florida Interfaith Worker Justice because the Catholic community was going to honor this person and he wanted to do away with this legislation. I arranged a meeting

with the Archbishop and he agreed to write an op ed article about the importance of these issues. He was also going to contact the State legislator who introduced the item and others in the State legislature. Hopefully it will not be passed.

2. CRB Committees

- **Criminal Justice and Law Enforcement: Youth Summit to Promote Non-Violence**

Vickie Smith Jackson, Committee Co-Chair reported that the CRB and the Miami-Dade Youth Commission will convene the Youth Summit to Promote Non-Violence on Thursday, March 28, 1-4 p.m. The Summit is part of the CRB's Action Plan to promote non-violence in response to the upcoming trial in the killing of Trayvon Martin. A Draft agenda is included in the meeting package. We are expecting youth from throughout the county to attend. CRB members are asked to contact youth groups to promote attendance. We need CRB volunteers and presence. The Summit will be held in the board of County Commission Chambers and will be televised. Amy Carswell invited the CRB members to have lunch with the Youth Commissions prior to the Summit on the third floor terrace. Dr. Capp stated that the larger issue is the one of racial profiling. A bill has been introduced in Washington to stop racial profiling by police and law enforcement by it has not gotten out of committee. Needs to be added as a next step where energy can be focused on empowerment and prevention for the future. Young people can make recommendations to the County Commission to support this legislation. It is bigger than Trayvon Martin, Miami-Dade County and the State. It is a national issue. Mr. Valdes asked Dr. Capp to prepare letter of recommendation to the CRB to forward to the County Commission.

- **Fair Immigration**

Reinaldo Valdes, Committee Co-Chair, announced that the Fair Immigration committee will meet on April 8th at 3 p.m. . Immigration is a critical issue in this country. Part of our economic recovery will be based on passing Fair Immigration legislation. Need to secure our borders; however 45 percent came in with tourist visas or work permits but remained here with expired visas. 65% to 70% of people in Miami-Dade County were born in another country. We can do business with our Latin American neighbors. We are spending tax dollars criminalizing, detaining and jailing people with no criminal records. We need strong presence and a voice in other organizations throughout the County. It is impairing ability for economic recovery. We have 700,000 - 800,000 undocumented people in Florida, mostly agricultural workers.

- **CRB 50th Anniversary Commemoration**

Dr. Larry Capp, Co-convener of the planning committee showed the 50th Anniversary poster that will also serve as the cover for the event's program. County Graphics Department prepared the poster along with the Save The Date invitation. The committee has distributed sponsorship packages. Letters are available that have been signed by Foundation members and available in email format. We have met with Miami-Dade College who will host the Commemoration Conference. Ed Harris assigned from Commissioner Suarez' office to work on this. We are assigning panelists

for the workshops and looking to secure keynote speakers. A couple thousand dollars are now in the bank and a couple thousand have been pledged. Full financial report and final budget will be presented at next month's CRB meeting. Mr. Valdes, Committee Co-Convener, asked that members make ourselves responsible to secure $1,000 donations. If you cannot come up with it personally, you can identify people or business who can. The 50th Anniversary is an important event for us where we can gain community exposure.

3. CRB Chair's Report

Chairs Report 1) Reminded CRB members to complete Financial Disclosure Statements for 2012 needed to comply with County Ordinance. 2) Friends of former Senator Bullard - information about memorial services included in meeting package. She was a leader who embodied the CRB mission of building bridges, of mutual understanding and respect. She will be sorely missed. 3) Important court case in Miami-Dade County that resulted in a conviction under the Florida Hate Crimes Statute. Jury convicted a Hialeah man for two counts of aggravated assault over an attack of two African-American men who he tried to run over with his truck for no apparent reason other than race. He could be sentenced for up to 30 years for each count under this Statute. Case is one of the few times these Statutes used in such a high profile case. We hope no further instance like this will occur. 4) Pursuant to a discussion at the February CRB meeting, the City of Miami Civilian Investigative Panel was continuing its review of police involved shooting of Carlos Moore shooting. Mr. Moore was unarmed when shot and killed three years ago. This case is among the most controversial of the seven shootings of black men by police during that period. 5) Mayor Gimenez and School Superintendent Carvalho have announced results of an important initiative convened in our community. The Joint Roundtable of Youth Safety announced its Community Action Plan on March 6. The Community Action Plan is available on the Mayors website. Encouraged CRB members to get involved in this program. 7) Youth Safety-CRB been monitoring community tensions in North Central Miami-Dade regarding shootings involving young people, including several teenagers. We anticipate a community meeting in the near future. 8) The CRB General Membership on April 17th will host a conversation with Chief Patterson, newly appointed Director of the Miami-Dade County Police Department. We are compiling questions and need your input about issues and concerns. 9) I attended the American Jewish Committee breakfast for Hispanic community leadership. 10) The Princeton Prize Meeting held Monday to select local students to award scholarships to that have worked toward inter-group relations in the community. This initiative recognizes high school students for special work in race relations. There were 29 applicants. One young lady was selected. A ceremony will be in May and CRB members are welcome to participate.

4. New Business

Martha Rovirosa stated that she would like to recognize Priscilla Dames-Blake for being recognized 3 times this week by the following organizations: In the Company of Women, Top Minority Business Award, and Citizens of the Year Award.

5. **The meeting was adjourned.**

COMMUNITY RELATIONS BOARD
MEETING DATE: _March 20, 2013

	MEMBERS	PRESENT	LATE	ABSENT
1	*Mario Artecona,*	x		
2	*Dr. Larry Capp*	x		
3	*Lyse Cuellar-Vidal*			x
4	*Priscilla Dames-Blake*	x		
5	*Valerie Lynn Davis-Bailey*	x		
6	*Michell Dunaj Lucking*			x
7	*Ronald Fulton*	x		
8	*Rev. Eddie Gervais*	x		
9	*Martha Gonzolez-Rovirosa*	x		
10	*Ahmed Kabani*			x
11	*Dr. Faisal Kaleem*			x
12	*Harlene Kennedy*			x
13	*Maritza Lopez*			x
14	*Herman Martinez*	x		
15	*Lovette McGill*			x
16	*Dr. Helen Lawrence McGuire*			x
17	*Dr. Walter Richardson*			x
18	*Wilfredo Ruiz*			x
19	*Brian Siegal*			x
20	*Rabbi Solomon Schiff*	x		
21	*Edward Shohat*			x
22	*Vickie M. Smith Jackson*	x		
23	*Farzana M. Tapia*	x		

COMMUNITY RELATIONS BOARD
MEETING DATE: March 20, 2013

24	***Adam Tavakoly***			x
25	***Reinaldo Valdes***	x		
26	***Dr. Harold A. Vieux***			x
27	***L. George Yap***	x		
28	***Marjorie York***	x		