MEMORANDUM

Agenda Item No. 7(A)

TO:

Honorable Chairman Joe A. Martinez

and Members, Board of County Commissioners

DATE:

October 2, 2012

FROM: R. A. Cuevas, Jr.

County Attorney

SUBJECT:

Ordinance pertaining to

animals; expanding definition

of acts deemed cruelty to animals; amending regulations pertaining to dangerous dogs

This item was amended at the Public Safety and Healthcare Administration Committee on 9-11-12 to eliminate the requirement that the Dangerous Dog Registry website be searchable.

The accompanying ordinance was placed on the agenda at the request of Prime Sponsor Commissioner Jose "Pepe" Diaz and Co-Sponsors Commissioner Esteban L. Bovo, Jr., Commissioner Sally A. Heyman and Commissioner Barbara J. Jordan.

County At

RAC/cp





Date:

October 2, 2012

To:

Honorable Chairman Joe A. Martinez

and Members, Board of County Commissioners

From:

Carlos A. Gimenez

Mayor

Subject:

Ordinance Amending Regulations Pertaining to Dangerous Dogs and Registry

The proposed ordinance calls for the creation of a Dangerous Dog Registry. The labor to develop and post the registry online is minimal and can be absorbed by existing resources. In addition, the ordinance proposes various increases in code enforcement fees that are estimated to generate approximately \$44,000 for the department.

Alina T. Hudak

Deputy Mayor/County Manager

Fis9212



TO:

Honorable Chairman Joe A. Martinez

DATE:

October 2, 2012

and Members, Board of County Commissioners

FROM:

R. A. Cuevas, Jr.

County Attorney

SUBJECT:

Agenda Item No. 7(A)

Please note any items checked.

· .	"3-Day Rule" for committees applicable if raised
· · · · · · · · · · · · ·	6 weeks required between first reading and public hearing
· .	4 weeks notification to municipal officials required prior to public hearing
	Decreases revenues or increases expenditures without balancing budget
	Budget required
	Statement of fiscal impact required
	Ordinance creating a new board requires detailed County Manager's report for public hearing
	No committee review
	Applicable legislation requires more than a majority vote (i.e., 2/3's, 3/5's, unanimous) to approve
	Current information regarding funding source, index code and available

Approved	<u>M</u>	<u>layor</u>	Agenda Item No.	7(A)
Veto			10-2-12	
Override				

ORDINANCE NO.

ORDINANCE PERTAINING TO ANIMALS: **ACTS EXPANDING** DEFINITION OF DEEMED CRUELTY TO ANIMALS: AMENDING REGULATIONS PERTAINING TO DANGEROUS DOGS; CREATING DANGEROUS DOG REGISTRY: CREATING REGULATIONS FOR AGGRESSIVE DOGS; CREATING RESTRICTIONS ON IRRESPONSIBLE DOG OWNERS: INCREASING PENALTIES FOR FIGHTING OF DOGS OR OTHER ANIMALS: INCREASING PENALTIES FOR INJURIES CAUSED BY DOGS; AMENDING SECTIONS 5-4, 5-22, 5-23 AND 8CC-10 OF THE CODE OF MIAMI-DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA; CREATING SECTIONS 5-23.1 AND 5-23.2 OF THE CODE OF MIAMI-DADE COUNTY: **PROVIDING** AUTHORITY ENFORCEMENT BY CIVIL PENALTY: PROVIDING SEVERABILITY, INCLUSION IN THE CODE, AND AN EFFECTIVE DATE

WHEREAS, this Board desires to encourage the humane treatment of dogs and other animals, to promote responsible pet ownership, and to protect people and their pets from irresponsible dog owners; and

WHEREAS, under Section 5-4(b) of the Code of Miami-Dade County, the use of an animal for fighting is an act of cruelty to animals, and this Board considers animal fighting to be especially heinous and intolerable and therefore desires to increase the penalty for this act of cruelty; and

WHEREAS, under Section 5-22(b) of the Code of Miami-Dade County, the owner of a dog is liable: if a dog, when unprovoked, endangers, attacks, or bites a person or severely injures or kills a pet; is used or trained for fighting; or menaces a person in a public area; and

WHEREAS, a recent judicial decision and an amendment to state law require Miami-Dade County to amend existing regulations for designating a dog as dangerous and subjecting a dog to additional restrictions applicable only to dangerous dogs; and

WHEREAS, this Board desires to keep a record of dogs that have injured other pets but that cannot be designated as dangerous under state law; and

WHEREAS, this Board wishes to create a Dangerous Dog Registry to inform the residents of Miami-Dade County about dangerous dogs in their neighborhoods; and

WHEREAS, this Board desires to create regulations for irresponsible dog owners and to increase the penalties for injuries caused by dogs,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDAINED BY THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS OF MIAMI-DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA:

Section 1. Section 5-4 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby amended to read as follows: 1

Sec. 5-4. - Cruelty to animals.

* * * *

- (b) Acts deemed cruelty to animals. It shall be unlawful to commit any act that constitutes cruelty to animals. The following acts shall be deemed cruelty to animals (see Sections 828.12, 828.13 and 828.16, Florida Statutes):
 - (1) To torture, torment, mutilate, kill, or unnecessarily overdrive any animal or to cause the same to be done.
 - >>(1.1) To engage in animal fighting,<< [[Using an animal for the purpose of fighting,]] including, without limitation, dog fighting or cock fighting [[, shall be deemed to be a violation of this provision]]. >>For purposes of this section, to be engaged in animal fighting means to instigate, promote, assist, hold, manage,

Words stricken through and/or [[double bracketed]] shall be deleted. Words underscored and/or >>double arrowed<< constitute the amendment proposed. Remaining provisions are now in effect and remain unchanged.



stage, conduct, be employed in connection with, be present for the preparation of, provide an animal for, allow one's own real or personal property to be used for, gamble on, be a spectator at, or profit from an exhibition, contest, or event featuring the fighting of an animal with another animal during which an animal may be injured, maimed, or killed.

(c) Enforcement.

>>(3) Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, for enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a second violation of this section shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in Section 8CC-10, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3.5 times the listed penalty.<

Section 2. Section 5-20 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby amended to read as follows:

Sec. 5-20. - Regulations on dogs in public areas.

>>(g) Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, for enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a second violation of this section shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in Section 8CC-10, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3.5 times the listed penalty.<<

Section 3. Section 5-21 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby amended to read as follows:

Sec. 5-21. - Tethering of dogs.

* * * *

(e) For a first-time violation, the Department shall issue a warning notice to the responsible party and shall wait at least thirty (30) days before taking any further enforcement action against the responsible party. Thereafter, each violation of this section shall be subject to enforcement in accordance with Section 5-2 of this chapter. >> Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, or enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in Section 8CC-10, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty.<< For all civil penalties for violations of this section collected pursuant to Chapter 8CC, 75% of the amount collected shall be paid to the Animal Services Trust Fund, created by Miami-Dade County Resolution No. R-1385-06, as may be amended from time to time.

Section 4. Section 5-22 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby amended to read as follows:

Sec. 5-22. - Dangerous dogs; authority to designate dog as dangerous; confiscation; appeal procedures.

- (a) For purposes of this section >>,<< [[and]] § 5-23 >>, and § 5-23.1<< of this chapter, the following definitions shall apply:
 - (1) Dangerous dog means any dog that has been designated as dangerous by the Department pursuant to this section.
 - (2) Unprovoked means that the victim was acting peacefully and lawfully when encountering the dog and that the dog was not acting defensively or responding to a threat.
 - (3) Severe injury means any physical injury that results in: wounds from multiple bites; a deep puncture wound that requires drainage; a broken bone; or a disfiguring laceration requiring sutures or reconstructive surgery.
 - (4) Proper enclosure of a dangerous dog means that, while on the responsible party's property, a dangerous dog is securely confined indoors or in a securely enclosed and locked pen or structure, suitable to prevent the entry of young children and designed to prevent the animal from escaping. Such pen or structure shall have secure sides and a secure top to prevent the dog from escaping over, under, or through the structure, and shall also provide protection from the elements. The pen or structure



shall allow the dog to make normal postural movements and to walk around and shall also comply with the minimum standards for primary enclosures set forth in § 5-9(b)(1)-(3) of this chapter.

- (b) The responsible party shall be liable [[if a dog commits]] >> for << any of the following acts:
 - (1) >> <u>His or her dog</u> << [[To]], when unprovoked, endanger>> <u>s</u> <<, attack> <u>s</u> <<, or bite>> <u>s</u> << a human;
 - (2) >><u>His or her dog</u><< [[To]], when unprovoked and while off the responsible party's property, >><u>attacks or bites</u><< [[severely injure or kill]] a domestic animal;
 - (3) >> He or she uses or trains a dog << [[To have been used]] for dog fighting[[, or to be trained for dog fighting]]; or
 - (4) >><u>His or her dog</u><< [[To]], when unprovoked, chase>><u>s</u><< or approach>><u>es</u><< a human in a menacing fashion or apparent attitude of attack upon the streets, sidewalks, or any other public property or common area of a private building or development.
- (c) The Director or designee shall designate a dog as dangerous if the dog commits one (1) or more of the [[acts specified in subsection (b) above.]] >> following acts:
 - (1) To, when unprovoked, endanger, attack, or bite a human;
 - (2) To, when unprovoked and while off the responsible party's property, severely injure or kill a domestic animal more than once;
 - (3) To, when unprovoked, chase or approach a human in a menacing fashion or apparent attitude of attack upon the streets, sidewalks, or any other public property or common area of a private building or development.

An individual desiring to have a dog designated as dangerous shall attest in a sworn affidavit to the incident giving rise to the request, but the Department may commence an investigation prior to receiving an affidavit. The Department shall not investigate anonymous complaints.

* * * *

>>(k) Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, for enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a second violation of this section shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in Section 8CC-10, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3.5 times the listed penalty.<<

Section 5-23 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby amended

to read as follows:

Sec. 5-23. - Additional regulations relating to dangerous dogs.

- (a) Within fourteen (14) days after a dog has been designated as dangerous, or a dangerous dog designation is upheld on appeal, the responsible party shall obtain a certificate of registration for the dog from the Department. The responsible party shall renew the certificate annually. Certificates of registration and renewals thereof shall only be issued to competent persons who are at least eighteen (18) years of age and who present to the Department sufficient evidence that:
 - (1) The dog has been vaccinated in accordance with Section 5-6 of this chapter;
 - (2) The dog has been sterilized;
 - (3) The dog has been implanted with a microchip, the microchip has been registered with the national registry applicable to the microchip, and the microchip number and other identifying information have been provided to the Department;
 - (4) The dog shall be confined in a proper enclosure of a dangerous dog; and
 - (5) A clearly visible warning sign at all entry points informs both children and adults of the presence of a dangerous dog on the property.
 - >>(6) All information required for the Miami-Dade County Dangerous Dog Registry pursuant to subsection (i) below has been provided.<<
- (b) Prior to issuance of the certificate of registration and renewals thereof, the responsible party shall pay the Department a fee set by implementing order approved by the Board of County Commissioners.
- (c) The responsible party shall immediately notify the Department in writing:
 - (1) When a dangerous dog is loose or unconfined;
 - (2) When a dangerous dog has bitten a human or attacked another animal;
 - (3) Prior to a dangerous dog being sold or given away, or when a dangerous dog dies; or
 - (4) When a dangerous dog is moved to another address.
- (d) If a dangerous dog is sold or given away, the former responsible party shall provide the name, address, and telephone number of the new responsible party to the Department, shall update all relevant information with the national registry applicable to the microchip, and shall provide the Department with confirmation that the microchip information has been updated. The new responsible party shall comply with all of the

requirements of this chapter, even if the animal is later moved from this County to another county within the State. If a dog that has been designated by another jurisdiction as dangerous, aggressive, or similar classification is brought into Miami-Dade County, the responsible party shall immediately register the dog with the Department in accordance with this section.

>>(i) Dangerous Dog Registry. The Department shall maintain a publicly<< >>accessible<<² [[searchable]] >>website, called the "Miami-Dade County Dangerous Dog Registry," of all dangerous dogs registered with the Department. At the time of registration under subsection (a) above, the responsible party shall provide the following information to the Department, to be posted on the Dangerous Dog Registry: the name and address of the owner of the dangerous dog; the address where the dangerous dog is maintained; the name, sex, age, weight, primary breed, secondary breed, and color and markings of the dangerous dog; a photograph of the dangerous dog; the most recent vaccination date of the dangerous dog and the expiration date of the vaccine; the microchip number of the dangerous dog; and the case numbers of any judicial or administrative proceedings concerning the matters that resulted in the dog being declared dangerous. The Dangerous Dog Registry entry for each dangerous dog shall also include a brief description of the incident or incidents that resulted in the dog being declared dangerous.

(j) Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, for enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a second violation of this section shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in Section 8CC-10, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3.5 times the listed penalty.<<

Section 6. Section 5-23.1 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby created to read as follows:

² Committee amendments are indicated as follows: Words double stricken through and/or [[double bracketed]] are deleted, words double underlined and/or >>double arrowed<< are added.

Sec. 5-23.1. - Aggressive dogs; authority to designate dog as aggressive; appeal procedures; additional regulations on aggressive dogs.

(a) Definitions. "Aggressive dog" means any dog that has been designated as aggressive by the Department pursuant to this section.

(b) The Director or designee shall designate a dog as "aggressive" if the dog, when unprovoked and while off of the owner's property, severely injures or kills a domestic animal.

- (1) An individual desiring to have a dog designated as aggressive shall attest in a sworn affidavit to the incident giving rise to the request, but the Department may commence an investigation prior to receiving an affidavit. The Department shall not investigate anonymous complaints.
- (2) A dog that is the subject of an aggressive dog investigation shall not, without the prior written approval of the Director or designee, be relocated, sold, or given away pending the outcome of an investigation or any hearings related to the determination of an aggressive dog designation.
- (c) Procedures. If the Director or designee determines that there is sufficient cause to designate the dog as aggressive, written notification of that determination shall be delivered to the responsible party by registered mail, certified hand delivery, or service of process in conformance with Chapter 48, Florida Statutes. That determination, and any related fines issued pursuant to Chapter 8CC of this Code, may be appealed by providing, within seven (7) calendar days of receipt of the written notification, a written request for an administrative hearing; the request shall be delivered to the address provided on the written notice. If a request for a hearing is received more than seven (7) calendar days from the receipt of the written notification, the hearing officer shall be precluded from exercising jurisdiction, and the appeal shall be dismissed as untimely.
- (d) Appeal procedures. Upon receipt of a timely written request for an administrative hearing, the Director or designee shall schedule an administrative hearing to be held not later than 21 calendar days, and not sooner than 5 days, after receipt of the written request. The administrative hearing shall be conducted in accordance with the provisions set forth in Chapter 8CC of this Code. Determinations of aggressiveness and fines based on the same incident shall be heard at the same administrative hearing. No person aggrieved by a determination to designate a dog as aggressive may apply to the Court for relief unless he has first exhausted the remedies provided for herein and taken all available steps provided in this section. While an appeal is pending, the determination shall be stayed.
- (e) Registration. Within 14 days after a dog has been designated as aggressive or an aggressive dog designation is upheld on appeal, the

responsible party shall obtain a certificate of registration for the dog from the Department. The responsible party shall renew the certificate annually. Certificates of registration and renewals thereof shall only be issued to a competent person who is at least 18 years of age and who presents to the department sufficient evidence that:

- (1) The dog has been vaccinated in accordance with § 5-6 of this chapter;
- (2) The dog has been licensed in accordance with § 5-7 of this chapter; and
- (3) The dog has been implanted with a microchip, the microchip has been registered with the national registry applicable to the microchip, and the microchip number and other identifying information have been provided to the Department.

Prior to issuance of the certificate of registration and renewals thereof, the responsible party shall pay the Department a fee set by implementing order approved by the Board of County Commissioners.

- (f) If a dog that has been designated by another jurisdiction as aggressive or similar classification is brought into Miami-Dade County, the responsible party shall immediately register the dog with the Department as an aggressive dog in accordance with this section.
- (g) Additional regulations on aggressive dogs.
 - (1) The responsible party shall immediately notify the Department in writing when an aggressive dog has been moved to another address.
 - (2) If an aggressive dog is sold or given away, the former responsible party shall provide the name, address, and telephone number of the new responsible party to the Department, shall update all relevant information with the national registry applicable to the microchip, and shall provide the Department with confirmation that the microchip information has been updated. The new responsible party shall comply with all of the requirements of this chapter even if the animal is later moved from this County to another county within the State.
 - (3) The responsible party shall immediately notify the Department in writing when an aggressive dog has bitten a human or a domestic animal.
 - (4) Restrictions on breeding. It shall be unlawful to breed, or to permit another to use for breeding, an aggressive dog.
- (h) If an aggressive dog severely injures or kills a domestic animal, it may be designated as "dangerous" pursuant to § 5-22 of this chapter.
- (i) Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 8CC-4 governing the penalties for repeat or continuing violations, for enforcement by civil penalty in accordance with Chapter 8CC of this code, a second violation of this section shall carry a civil penalty of 2.5 times the penalty listed in

Section 8CC-10, a third violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3 times the listed penalty, and each subsequent violation shall carry a civil penalty of 3.5 times the listed penalty.

Section 7. Section 5-23.2 of the Code of Miami-Dade County is hereby created to read as follows:

Sec. 5-23.2. – Irresponsible Dog Owners.

- (a) A person shall be designated as an "irresponsible dog owner" upon being found guilty, more than once, of (i) violating Sections 5-20, 5-21, 5-22, 5-23, or 5-23.1 of this code or (ii) committing upon a dog an act deemed cruelty to animals in violation of Section 5-4 of this code. For purposes of this section, "found guilty" means that a citation for such violation has been issued and either the citation has not been appealed or, if the citation is appealed, the action of the code enforcement officer has been affirmed on appeal. The designation shall take effect on the later of (i) the date that the time to appeal an enforcement action expires or (ii) the date a decision affirming the enforcement action is rendered.
- (b) An irresponsible dog owner shall be prohibited from acquiring, owning, keeping, or harboring additional dogs for a period of 3 years after being so designated. Upon a subsequent violation of any of the provisions listed in Sub-section (a) above, an irresponsible dog owner shall be prohibited from acquiring, owning, keeping, or harboring additional dogs for a period of 5 years after being found guilty of the subsequent violation.
- (c) An irresponsible dog owner may be required to surrender to the Department all the dogs he owns, keeps, or harbors upon designation or after subsequent violations. The Director is hereby authorized to institute appropriate proceedings in any court of competent jurisdiction to effectuate the seizure of the dogs.

Section 8. Section 8CC-10 of the Code of Miami-Dade County, Florida is hereby amended to read as follows:

Sec. 8CC-10. Schedule of civil penalties.

The following table shows the sections of this Code, as they may be amended from time to time, which may be enforced pursuant to the provisions of this chapter; and the dollar amount of civil penalty for the violation of these sections as they may be amended.

* * * *

Code Section	Description of Violation	Civil Penalty
A STATE OF THE STA	* * * *	
5-4	Cruelty to animals	500.00
	>>Animal fighting or baiting	<u>1,000.00</u> <<
***************************************	* * * *	
5-22[[(b)(1)]]	Dog endangers, attacks, or bites a human	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-22(b)(2)]]	Dog severely injures or kills domestic animal	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-22(b)(3)]]	Dog used for or trained for dog fighting	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-22(b)(4)]]	Dog chases or approaches human in menacing fashion	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-22(e)]]	Failure to confine dog during dangerous dog investigation or hearings	>> <u>200.00</u> << [[100.00]]
	Failure to provide address where the animal resides	>> <u>200.00</u> << [[100.00]]
[[5-22(f)]]	Relocating dog during dangerousness investigation or hearing	>> <u>200.00</u> << [[100.00]]
	Transfer of ownership during dangerousness investigation or hearing	>> <u>200.00</u> << [[100.00]]
[[5-22(i)]]	Failure to confine dog pending resolution of appeal	>> <u>500.00</u> << [[250.00]]
[[5-22(j)]]	Dog not previously classified as dangerous severely injures or kills human	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
5-23[[(a)]]	Failure to register, or timely renew registration of, dangerous dog	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(c)(1)]]	Failure to notify Department that dangerous dog is loose or unconfined	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(e)(2)]]	Failure to notify Department that dangerous dog has bitten a human or attacked another animal	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]

Code Section	Description of Violation	Civil Penalty
[[5-23(c)(3)]]	Failure to notify Department that dangerous dog has been sold, given away, or died	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(e)(4)]]	Failure to notify Department that dangerous dog has been moved to another address	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(d)]]	Failure to notify Department of new owner of dangerous dog	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(e)]]	Failure to muzzle dangerous dog	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
	Failure to restrain dangerous dog	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
[[5-23(f)]]	Dangerous dog attacks/bites human or domestic animal	>> <u>1,000.00</u> << [[500.00]]
>> <u>5-23.1</u>	Failure to register, or timely renew registration of, aggressive dog	500.00
	Failure to notify Department that aggressive dog has been moved to another address	500.00
	Failure to notify Department that aggressive dog has bitten a human or domestic animal	500.00
	Failure to notify Department of new owner of aggressive dog	500.00
	Breeding of aggressive dog	1,000.00
5-23.2	Irresponsible owner acquires additional dog	<u>500.00</u> <<
A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	* * * *	

Section 9. If any section, subsection, sentence, clause or provision of this ordinance is held invalid, the remainder of this ordinance shall not be affected by such invalidity.

<u>Section 10</u>. It is the intention of the Board of County Commissioners, and it is hereby ordained that the provisions of this ordinance, including any sunset provision, shall become and be made part of the Code of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The sections of this

Agenda Item No. 7(A) Page No. 13

ordinance may be renumbered or relettered to accomplish such intention, and the word "ordinance" may be changed to "section," "article," or other appropriate word.

Section 11. This ordinance shall become effective ten (10) days after the date of enactment unless vetoed by the Mayor, and if vetoed, shall become effective only upon an override by this Board.

PASSED AND ADOPTED:

Approved by County Attorney as to form and legal sufficiency:

Prepared by:

Dennis A. Kerbel

Prime Sponsor: Co-sponsors:

Commissioner Jose "Pepe" Diaz Commissioner Esteban L. Bovo, Jr.

Commissioner Sally A. Heyman