

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

Rolando Roque, WASD	Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County	Frederick Bloetscher, FAU	Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami	Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach	SUB-TOTAL	Average	Low Disparity	High Disparity	TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES	TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES	QUALITATIVE RANKING	ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)
---------------------	-----------------------------------	---------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------	---------	---------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------------	---------------------	---

NAME OF FIRM(S)

<b>1</b>	<b>STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES, INC.</b>													
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	46	40	27	50	25	188	38	25	50	408	10	3	2
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	17	20	12	20	18	87	17	12	23				
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	20	12	20	19	88	18	12	23				
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	5	5	4	4	5	23	5	3	6				
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	5	5	5	4	3	22	4	3	6				
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	90	90	60	98	70								
		3	2	1	3	9								
		3	2	1	5	10								
	Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A													
<b>2</b>	<b>MILIAN, SWAIN &amp; ASSOCIATES, INC.</b>													
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	46	40	26	45	50	207	41	28	55	402	16	5	5
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	17	15	12	15	20	79	16	11	21				
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	15	12	15	20	79	16	11	21				
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	1	3	4	3	15	3	2	4				
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	4	4	5	5	22	4	3	6				
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	88	75	57	84	98								
		5	5	3	8	1								
		6	6	4	11	1								
	Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A													

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

<b>Rolando Roque, WASD</b>	<b>Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County</b>	<b>Frederick Bloetscher, FAU</b>	<b>Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami</b>	<b>Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach</b>	<b>SUB-TOTAL</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Low Disparity</b>	<b>High Disparity</b>	<b>TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES</b>	<b>TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES</b>	<b>QUALITATIVE RANKING</b>	<b>ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)</b>
----------------------------	--	----------------------------------	---------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	------------------	----------------	----------------------	-----------------------	---------------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------------	--

NAME OF FIRM(S)

<b>3</b>	<b>CIVIL WORKS, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	41	25	25	45	25	161	32	22	43	331	36
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	16	10	10	15	10	61	12	8	16		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	16	15	11	15	18	75	15	10	20		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	3	3	2	3	15	3	2	4		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	3	3	5	4	19	4	3	5		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	8	10	6	9	11						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	12	12	9	12	12						13
<b>4</b>	<b>SRS ENGINEERING, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	45	38	22	49	35	189	38	25	50	391	21
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	16	15	8	19	20	78	16	10	21		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	18	9	19	20	83	17	11	22		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	5	3	4	2	5	19	4	3	5		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	5	4	3	5	5	22	4	3	6		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	5	4	9	6	4						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	7	5	13	9	4						6

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

<b>Rolando Roque, WASD</b>	<b>Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County</b>	<b>Frederick Bloetscher, FAU</b>	<b>Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami</b>	<b>Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach</b>	<b>SUB-TOTAL</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Low Disparity</b>	<b>High Disparity</b>	<b>TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES</b>	<b>TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES</b>	<b>QUALITATIVE RANKING</b>	<b>ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)</b>
----------------------------	--	----------------------------------	---------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	------------------	----------------	----------------------	-----------------------	---------------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------------	--

**NAME OF FIRM(S)**

<b>5</b>	<b>A &amp; P CONSULTING TRANSPORTATION ENGINEERS CORP.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	46	35	27	50	35	193	39	26	51	382	15
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	17	12	12	20	18	79	16	11	21		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	10	11	20	15	73	15	10	19		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	1	3	4	2	14	3	2	4		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	5	4	5	5	4	23	5	3	6		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	4	8	2	2	7						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	5	9	2	2	8						7
<b>6</b>	<b>CARDOZO ENGINEERING, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	45	40	25	48	40	198	40	27	53	407	17
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	17	20	11	19	15	82	16	11	22		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	20	11	19	18	85	17	11	23		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	5	4	3	2	5	19	4	3	5		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	5	5	4	5	4	23	5	3	6		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	4	3	5	7	5						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	4	4	7	10	6						4

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

<b>Rolando Roque, WASD</b>	<b>Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County</b>	<b>Frederick Bloetscher, FAU</b>	<b>Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami</b>	<b>Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach</b>	<b>SUB-TOTAL</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Low Disparity</b>	<b>High Disparity</b>	<b>TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES</b>	<b>TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES</b>	<b>QUALITATIVE RANKING</b>	<b>ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)</b>
----------------------------	--	----------------------------------	---------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	------------------	----------------	----------------------	-----------------------	---------------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------------	--

NAME OF FIRM(S)

<b>7</b>	<b>C.A.P. ENGINEERING, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	41	35	25	40	35	176	35	24	47	358	28
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	16	15	11	15	10	67	13	9	18		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	16	14	10	18	19	77	15	10	20		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	3	4	2	5	18	4	2	5		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	4	4	5	3	20	4	3	5		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	8	6	5	10	8						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	11	7	8	13	9						11
<b>8</b>	<b>ROBAYNA AND ASSOCIATES, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	40	33	24	50	25	172	34	23	46	355	32
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	16	15	9	20	10	70	14	9	19		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	15	12	10	18	17	72	14	10	19		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	5	4	4	3	5	21	4	3	6		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	4	4	5	3	20	4	3	5		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	9	7	7	5	11						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	13	8	11	8	13						12

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

Rolando Roque, WASD	Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County	Frederick Bloetscher, FAU	Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami	Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach	SUB-TOTAL	Average	Low Disparity	High Disparity	TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES	TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES	QUALITATIVE RANKING	ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)
---------------------	-----------------------------------	---------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------	---------	---------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------------	---------------------	---

**NAME OF FIRM(S)**

<b>9</b>	<b>A.D.A. ENGINEERING, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	42	32	24	50	35	183	37	25	49	363	30
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	16	14	11	20	10	71	14	10	19		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	10	10	20	19	76	15	10	20		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	1	2	5	1	13	3	2	3		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	3	4	5	4	20	4	3	5		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	7	9	7	1	10						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	10	10	10	1	11						11
<b>11</b>	<b>PREMIERE DESIGN SOLUTIONS, INC.</b>											
	1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)	42	30	21	50	40	183	37	25	49	366	27
	2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)	17	12	8	20	15	72	14	10	19		
	3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)	17	10	11	20	19	77	15	10	20		
	4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)	4	1	3	4	3	15	3	2	4		
	5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)	4	3	4	5	3	19	4	3	5		
	<b>ORDINAL SCORES</b>	6	10	8	2	6						
	<b>Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A</b>	9	11	12	4	7						9

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

Rolando Roque, WASD	Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County	Frederick Bloetscher, FAU	Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami	Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach	SUB-TOTAL	Average	Low Disparity	High Disparity	TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES	TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES	QUALITATIVE RANKING	ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)
---------------------	-----------------------------------	---------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------	---------	---------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------------	---------------------	---

**NAME OF FIRM(S)**

**12 EAC CONSULTING, INC.**

- 1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)
- 2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)
- 3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)
- 4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)
- 5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)

**ORDINAL SCORES**

**Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A**

**13 KING ENGINEERING ASSOCIATES, INC.**

- 1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)
- 2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)
- 3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)
- 4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)
- 5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)

**ORDINAL SCORES**

**Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A**

42	20	27	50	45	184	37	25	49	379	17	8	7
17	10	11	20	20	78	16	10	21				
17	18	12	20	17	84	17	11	22				
4	1	2	4	2	13	3	2	3				
4	2	4	5	5	20	4	3	5				
84	51	56	99	89								
6	11	4	2	3								
8	13	6	3	3								
47	50	27	50	45	219	44	29	58	439	6	1	1
18	20	11	20	20	89	18	12	24				
19	19	12	20	20	90	18	12	24				
4	3	3	2	4	16	3	2	4				
5	5	5	5	5	25	5	3	7				
93	97	58	97	94								
1	1	2	4	2								
1	1	3	7	2								

**FIRST - TIER MEETING  
APRIL 21, 2014**

**COMPETITIVE SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MIAMI-DADE WATER AND SEWER DEPARTMENT  
DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION  
OF A PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-03**

**TABULATION SHEET**

Rolando Roque, WASD	Michael Gleman, Palm Beach County	Frederick Bloetscher, FAU	Elyrosa Estevez, City of Miami	Jay Fink, City of Miami Beach	SUB-TOTAL	Average	Low Disparity	High Disparity	TOTAL QUALITATIVE SCORES	TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES	QUALITATIVE RANKING	ORDINAL RANKING (PENDING CBE COMPLIANCE REVIEW)
---------------------	-----------------------------------	---------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------	---------	---------------	----------------	--------------------------	----------------------	---------------------	---

**NAME OF FIRM(S)**

**14 CES CONSULTANTS, INC.**

- 1A - Qualification of firms including team members associated to the project (Max. 50 points)
- 2A - Knowledge and Past Experience of similar type projects (Max. 20 points)
- 3A - Past Performance of the Firms (Max. 20 points)
- 4A - Amount of Work Awarded and Paid by the County (Max. 5 points)
- 5A - Ability of team members to interface with the County (Max 5 points)

**ORDINAL SCORES**

**Tie-Breaker No. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 / Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, Total Qual. Points for Criteria 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A**

**Denotes high and low scores dropped**

**Faith Samuels, ISD Chairperson**

**Preliminary Ranking Pending CBE Compliance Review**

47	48	27	50	40	212	42	28	56	417	13	2	3
18	15	12	20	15	80	16	11	21				
18	19	10	20	19	86	17	12	23				
4	2	3	3	3	15	3	2	4				
5	5	4	5	5	24	5	3	6				
92	89	56	98	82								
2	3	4	3	5								
2	3	5	6	5								