

**SECOND-TIER MEETING
AUGUST 14, 2014**

**OWNER'S REPRESENTATIVE FOR PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING
SERVICES RELATING TO THE STATE OF FLORIDA'S OCEAN OUTFALL
LEGISLATION AND MIAMI-DADE COUNTY'S WASTEWATER SYSTEM
ISD PROJECT NO. E13-WASD-11**

TABULATION SHEET

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Bertha Goldenberg, WASD

Isaac Smith, WASD

Li Gurau, PROS

Mariano V. Fernandez, City of
Miami Beach

Mario Berrios, PWWM

SUB-TOTAL

Average

Low Disparity

High Disparity

TOTAL QUALITATIVE POINTS

QUALITATIVE RANKING

TOTAL ORDINAL SCORES

ORDINAL RANKING

FINAL RANK

NAME OF FIRM(S)

1	CAROLLO ENGINEERS, INC.															
	1B - Knowledge of Project Scope (50 points)	43	48	47	45	48	231	46	31	61						
	2B - Qualifications of team members assigned to the project (40 points)	40	39	35	35	37	186	37	25	49						
	3B - Ability to provide required services within schedule and budget (10 points)	8	9	8	10	10	45	9	6	12	462					
	ORDINAL SCORES	91	96	90	90	95						3	12	3	3	
	3	3	2	3	3	1										
	Tie Breaker (TB) 1, 2, 3, Criteria (CR) 1B, 2B, 3B, Total Qualitative Points 1B, 2B, 3B															
2	MWH AMERICAS, INC.															
	1B - Knowledge of Project Scope (50 points)	45	47	49	48	45	234	47	31	62						
	2B - Qualifications of team members assigned to the project (40 points)	40	39	39	35	38	191	38	26	51						
	3B - Ability to provide required services within schedule and budget (10 points)	10	9	9	10	8	46	9	6	12	471					
	ORDINAL SCORES	95	95	97	93	91						2	10	2	2	
	1	1	3	1	2	3										
	Tie Breaker (TB) 1, 2, 3, Criteria (CR) 1B, 2B, 3B, Total Qualitative Points 1B, 2B, 3B															
3	CH2M HILL, INC.															
	1B - Knowledge of Project Scope (50 points)	43	49	48	50	47	237	47	32	63						
	2B - Qualifications of team members assigned to the project (40 points)	40	40	38	40	38	196	39	26	52						
	3B - Ability to provide required services within schedule and budget (10 points)	10	10	8	10	8	46	9	6	12	479					
	ORDINAL SCORES	93	99	94	100	93						1	8	1	1	
	2	2	1	2	1	2										
	Tie Breaker (TB) 1, 2, 3, Criteria (CR) 1B, 2B, 3B, Total Qualitative Points 1B, 2B, 3B															