

City Commission

George "Bud" Scholl July 7, 2017

Dana Goldman Vice Mayor

Cathy Jackson Miami-Dade County

Isaac Aelion Commissioner

Audit and Management Services Department

Jeanette Gatto Commissioner

701 NW 1st Court – Suite 8-175 Miami, FL 33136

Larisa Svechin Commissioner

Re: Written Response to Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review

Christopher J. Russo City Manager

Dear Ms. Jackson,

Hans Ottinot City Attorney

Jane A. Hines City Clerk, MMC

We are in receipt of our Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review report dated June 16, 2017. The purpose of this letter is to provide a written response to the audit findings within thirty days, as required.

Finding 1 – Use of Surtax Proceeds:

The City had \$188,756 of unspent Transportation Surtax Proceeds as of September 30, 2016.

Audit Recommendation:

Pursuant to CITT Resolution No. 09-055, The City should submit a revised Five-Year Transportation Plan to demonstrate how the \$188,756 will be used.

City Response:

Attached please find a revised Five-Year Transportation Plan demonstrating how the unspent funds of \$188,756 will be utilized during the 2017-18 Fiscal Year. Please note the City's original submission included a carryforward of \$166,479 (a portion of the \$188,756 noted by the auditors, resulting in an increase of only \$22,277 in unspent funds resulting from this review of 2009-2016).

Finding 2 – Accounting for Surtax-Related Expenditures:

Documents supporting claimed expenditures (e.g. invoices) did not specify the funding source.

Audit Recommendation:

The City should specify the funding source to enhance accountability.

City Response:

The City has amended its accounting procedures for Transportation (capital projectsrelated expenditures) of surtax funds for Fiscal Year 2016-17 to specify the funding source as recommended. This has been accomplished by including a project-specific transfer from CITT (Streets and Transportation Fund) to the Capital Projects Fund for claimed expenditures. Funding source is readily available/visible on invoices paid for Transit (operating) expenditures.

CITY OF SUNNY ISLES BEACH 18070 Collins Avenue Sunny Isles Beach, FL 33160 305.947.0606 www.sibfl.net



Miami-Dade County Audit and Management Services Department Written Response to Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review Page 2

Finding 3 – Shuttle Bus Maintenance Vendor:

From October 2008 through June 2012, contractor John Churchill was used by the City to maintain the SIB shuttle bus fleet, for an annual average fee of \$15,000, without a formal contract. It was not until July 2012 that Mr. Churchill was contracted to provide heating and air-conditioning services, and the Goodyear Tire and Rubber Co. for other maintenance services, in amounts not to exceed \$30,000 and \$60,000 annually. The Agreement with John Churchill was terminated in July 2016.

Audit Recommendation:

Prospectively, the City should endeavor to competitively solicit vendors, and formalize the Professional Service Agreements in writing.

City Response:

In July 2012, the City formalized its contracts with both shuttle bus fleet maintenance vendors, as noted above, self-correcting the noted deficiency. Under the oversight of the current Finance Director (hired July 2013), the City endeavors to follow its Purchasing Code (Chapter 62) as written, including following thorough competitive solicitation requirements. In 2016, after evaluation of shuttle bus fleet maintenance sources in our geographic area, and analysis of drug testing and background check requirements placed upon such vendors for their employees, the City contracted with another experienced governmental entity (the City of Hialeah, who operates and maintains a full service fleet maintenance facility) in order to provide proper and complete maintenance services on our shuttle bus fleet, by highly qualified personnel at the most reasonable price. This was formalized by Resolution 2016-2545 adopted by the City Commission on April 21, 2016 and Interlocal Agreement between the City of Sunny Isles Beach and the City of Hialeah dated May 10, 2016.

Finding 4 – Reporting Requirements:

The City submitted most of the required reports, albeit some were received late. In addition, two Annual Certification Letters (FYs 2009 and 2010) and the 3rd Quarterly Report for 2009 were unavailable for review. Further, Quarterly Reports did not always agree to the General Ledger.

Audit Recommendation:

Prospectively, the City should submit Reports timely and accurately.

City Response:

The City shall endeavor to submit Reports timely and accurately. Current internal processes, including electronic/paperless document retention (implemented 2012-2013) and a new accounting system (implemented 10/1/2014), have enhanced our data storage

CITY OF SUNNY ISLES BEACH 18070 Collins Avenue Sunny Isles Beach, FL 33160 305.947.0606 www.sibfl.net



Miami-Dade County Audit and Management Services Department Written Response to Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review Page 3

and reporting capabilities. Each quarterly report submission is electronically stored with the corresponding General Ledger reports and other backup materials used to generate it. Invoices and other source documents are readily available in electronic form as far back as 2012-13.

We appreciate the professionalism and flexibility of the audit staff assigned to our review. If there is anything else we may provide in the future, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Sincerely

Audra K. Cyrts-Whann

Finance Director

Cc: Christopher J. Russo, City Manager

Susan Simpson, CCS Director

Mauricio Betancur, Acting City Clerk

PTP/TRANSIT FIVE-YEAR MUNICIPAL TRANSIT IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM & QUARTERLY REPORTING

Instructions: Please complete un-shaded portions of this spreadsheet.
Unhide rows at end of spreadsheet as needed.

MUNICIPALITY:	City of Sunny Isles Beach
CONTACT NAME:	Audra K Curts-Whann
TITLE / POSITION:	Finance Director
TELEPHONE:	305-792-1775
E-MAIL:	acurts@sibfl.net
REPORT DATE:	

REVISED 07/07/2017

Five Year Plan Revised due to County Review Findings and Current Year Budget Amendments 2016-2017

REPORT DATE:																
			FY 2016-2017			FY 2017-2018			FY 2018-2019			FY 2019-2020			FY 2020-2021	
		Current P1	ΓP Allocation	\$ 636,006	Current I	PTP Allocation	\$ 904,356	Current F	TP Allocation	\$ 812,519	Current P	TP Allocation	\$ 830,657	Current	PTP Allocation	\$ 849,159
		Prior Yr	Unexpended	\$ 188,756	Prior Y	r Unexpended	\$ -	Prior Y	r Unexpended	\$ 0	Prior Yı	r Unexpended	\$ 0	Prior	r Unexpended	\$ 0
MOE: \$	129,926		Total Start	\$ 824,762		Total Start	\$ 904,356		Total Start	\$ 812,519		Total Start	\$ 830,658		Total Start	\$ 849,159
Project Name and	Estimated Total Proje	et	Funding			Funding			Funding			Funding			Funding	
	Start/End Date Cost (1)	Phase (2)	Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Source	Amount
Operation of the	Start mm/yy	I	PTP	562,555		PTP	614,716		PTP	628,809		PTP	643,184		PTP	657,846
Community Shuttle Bus Program which operates 12		<u> </u>	MOE	89,926		MOE	89,926		MOE	89,926		MOE	89,926		MOE	89,926
hours per day, 7 days per	10/01/2016															
week. Costs include staffing, fuel, repair &	End mm/yy															
maintenance of buses,	Ongoing 652,481	-														
insurance, etc. City-Wide	Ongoing 652,481 Start mm/yy		PTP	138,333		PTP	142,175		PTP	145,019		PTP	147,919		PTP	150,877
	Start IIIII/yy	l F	11	100,000			142,173			140,010	Į.		147,515			130,077
Bus Replacement (Carryover from FY 15-16 -	09/16	-														
	End mm/yy															
nor expensed.)		l l														
City-Wide	02/17 138,333															
	Start mm/yy	I	PTP	84,600		PTP	104,400		PTP			PTP			PTP	
											'					
Bus Shelter Improvements	11/16															
	End mm/yy															
On 145																
City-Wide	09/18 84,600 Start mm/yy		PTP	39,274		PTP	43,065		PTP	38,691		PTP	39,555		DTD	40,436
	Start IIIII/yy	l F	11	35,274			43,003			30,031	Į.		35,333			40,430
		ŀ														
	End mm/yy															
Allowable administrative costs at 5% of total transit	,,,	ŀ														
costs																
	Start mm/yy	1	PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
	End mm/yy															
	Start mm/yy		PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
		F									,					
	End mm/yy															
		i t														
(1) FOR CAPITAL PROJECTS ONLY			FY 2016-2017			FY 2017-2018			FY 2018-2019			FY 2019-2020			FY 2020-2021	
	Construction		AL Projected			TAL Projected		TO	TAL Projected			TAL Projected		т	OTAL Projected	
The state of the s	Right of Way Acquisition		Expenditure	\$ 914,688	.0	Expenditure			Expenditure		.0	Expenditure		10	Expenditure	
	Preliminary Engineering Feasibility Study	DTD D	ojected Start	\$ 824,762	DTD F	Projected Start	¢ 004.050	ртр о	rojected Start	\$ 812,519	DTD D	rojected Start	\$ 830,658	DTD	Projected Start	\$ 849,159
	Procurement Process		TP Projected	φ 024,/62		PTP Projected			PTP Projected			PTP Projected			PTP Projected	
	Service Planning		Expenditures	\$ 824,762	Less	Expenditures		Less	Expenditures			Expenditures		Less	Expenditures	
	Implementation Process		TP Projected		=	PTP Projected		=1	PTP Projected	,,,,,,		PTP Projected			PTP Projected	
ON:	On-Going		Unexpended	\$ -	_	Unexpended			Unexpended	\$ 0		Unexpended	\$ 0		Unexpended	\$ 0

OTH: Other

PTP/TRANSPORTATION FIVE-YEAR MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM & QUARTERLY REPORTING

& QUARTERLY REPORTING

Instructions: Please complete un-shaded portions of this spreadsheet. Un-hide rows at the end of

MUNICIPALITY:	City of Sunny Isles Beach
CONTACT NAME:	Audra K Curts-Whann
TITLE / POSITION:	Finance Director
TELEPHONE:	305-792-1775
E-MAIL:	acurts@sibfl.net

REVISED 07/07/2017

Five Year Plan Revised due to County Review Findings and Current Year Budget Amendments 2016-2017

E-MAIL:			ts@sibfl.net															
REPORT DATE:		300																
					FY 2016-2017			FY 2017-2018			FY 2018-2019			FY 2019-2020			FY 2020-2021	
				Current F	TP Allocation	\$ 250,618	Current F	TP Allocation	\$ -	Current I	PTP Allocation	\$ 109,925	Current	PTP Allocation	\$ 110,235	Current	PTP Allocation	\$ 110,551
			_	Prior Y	r Unexpended	\$ -	Prior Y	r Unexpended	\$ -	Prior Y	'r Unexpended	\$ -	Prior \	r Unexpended	\$ -	Prior	Yr Unexpended	\$ -
MOE:	\$	129,926]		Total Start	\$ 250,618		Total Start	\$ -		Total Start	\$ 109,925		Total Start	\$ 110,235		Total Start	\$ 110,551
Project Name and Description	Project Location	Estimated Start/End Date	Total Project Cost (1)	Phase (2)	Funding Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Funding Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Funding Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Funding Source	Amount	Phase (2)	Funding Source	Amount
		Start mm/yy			PTP MOE	40,000		PTP MOE	40,000		PTP MOE	40,000		PTP MOE	40,000		PTP MOE	40,000
Street Lighting and	City-Wide	10/01/2016			NOE	40,000		WOE	40,000		MOE	40,000		MOE	40,000		WOE	40,000
Maintenance	City-wide	End mm/yy																
		09/30/2017					-											
		Start mm/yy			PTP Streets Fund	45,000	<u>l</u>	PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
Road Repairs	City-Wide	10/01/2016			Streets Furiu	45,000												
nuau nepairs	City-wide	End mm/yy																
		09/30/2017																
		Start mm/yy			PTP			PTP			PTP Capital	109,925		PTP Capital	110,235 4,350,000		PTP Capital	110,551 2,250,000
Dadastics Didas	Collins Avenue	11/19									Capital	2,100,000		Capital	4,350,000		Capital	2,250,000
Pedestrian Bridges	Pedestrian Bridge at 17 Street / 180 Street	End mm/yy																
		11/21					1											
		Start mm/yy			PTP	250,618		PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
Pedestrian Emergency Bridge - Design, permitting and	Connecting 172 Street of the south to 174 Street	n 08/2015			Capital	5,051,612	1											
construction of a pedestrian emergency bridge where currently is inaccessible.	the south to 1/4 Street the north	End mm/yy																
currently is inaccessible.		09/2017					+											
		Start mm/yy			PTP		1	PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
Collins Avenue Sidewalk Improvements - removing old	Collins Avenue Sidewal						1				Capital	500,000		Capital	1,000,000			
damaged concrete and replacing it with pavers	Improvements (east and west)	End mm/yy																
		02/2020					-											
		Start mm/yy			PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
Roadway Resurfacing - miling	Collins Avenue from south border at 158	12/19					1				Capital	250,000		Capital	250,000		Capital	250,000
and paving	Street to the William Lehman Causeway to the north	e End mm/yy																
	nortn	12/22					-											
		Start mm/yy			PTP		1	PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
Sunny Isles Blvd Street Improvements - repaving	Sunny Isles Blvd from Collins Avenue to the	11/18						Capital	100,000									
Sunny Isles Blvd inclusive of restriping and the crosswalk	east and the Intracoasta Waterway to the west																	
painting.		05/19					-											
		Start mm/yy			PTP		1	PTP			PTP			PTP			PTP	
		End mm/yy																
(1) FOR CAPITAL PROJECT	S ONLY	•	•		FY 2016-2017	7		FY 2017-2018			FY 2018-2019			FY 2019-2020			FY 2020-2021	
(2) PHASE CODES:	CS	: Construction	ulellien		TAL Projected			TAL Projected	6 140.00		TAL Projected			TAL Projected		Te	OTAL Projected	A 0.650.554
		Right of Way Acq			Expenditure	ф 5,387,230		Expenditure	\$ 140,000		Expenditure	\$ 2,999,925		Expenditure	\$ 5,750,235		Expenditure	\$ 2,650,551
	FS	E: Feasibility Study			rojected Start	\$ 250,618		rojected Start	\$ -		Projected Start	\$ 109,925		Projected Start	\$ 110,235		Projected Start	\$ 110,551
		Procurement Pro Service Planning	cess	Less I	PTP Projected Expenditures	\$ 250,618		PTP Projected Expenditures	\$ -	Less	PTP Projected Expenditures	\$ 109,925	Less	PTP Projected Expenditures	\$ 110,235	Less	s PTP Projected Expenditures	\$ 110,551
		: Implementation P	rocess		PTP Projected			PTP Projected		=	PTP Projected		=	PTP Projected			= PTP Projected	
		: On-Going I: Other			Unexpended	\$ -		Unexpended	-		Unexpended	\$ -		Unexpended	\$ -		Unexpended	-
	-																	



AUDIT AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT OVERTOWN TRANSIT VILLAGE

701 NW 1st COURT – SUITE 8-175 MIAMI, FLORIDA 33136

TELEPHONE: 786-469-5900

FAX: 786-469-5933

June 16, 2017

Mr. Christopher J. Russo, City Manager City of Sunny Isles Beach 18070 Collins Avenue Sunny Isles Beach, Florida 33160

Re: Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review - City of Sunny Isles Beach

Dear Mr. Russo:

Enclosed is the above-captioned Audit Report that was previously discussed with your Staff. Although the Office of the Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust will be contacting you to resolve the audit findings, a written response is requested within 30 days.

We appreciate the courtesies and assistance provided to our staff during the audit process. Please contact Jacqueline Williams, Audit Manager, at 786-469-5900, if you have any questions or require further information.

Sincerely,

Cathy Jackson

Director

CJ:ag

Attachment

c: Charles D. Scurr, Executive Director, Office of the Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust Audra K. Curts-Whann, Finance Director, City of Sunny Isles Beach

Memorandum



Date:

June 16, 2017

To:

Charles D. Scurr, Executive Director

Office of the Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust (OCITT)

From:

Cathy Jackson, Director

Audit and Management Services Department

Subject:

Audit Report – Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review –

City of Sunny Isles Beach

PURPOSE AND SCOPE

We performed a review of the City of Sunny Isles Beach's use of Charter County Transportation System Surtax (Surtax) Proceeds remitted by Miami-Dade County (County) for the eight years ended September 30, 2016. The primary objective was to ensure Surtax Proceeds were used in compliance with the *Interlocal Agreement for Distribution, Use and Reporting of Charter County Transit System Surtax Proceeds Levied by Miami-Dade County* (Interlocal Agreement) executed on July 10, 2007. Additionally, we assessed resolution of prior audit findings referenced in our Report dated September 10, 2009 (Exhibit I).

BACKGROUND

County Ordinance (Ordinance) No. 02-116, enacted on July 9, 2002, imposed a one-half of one percent Surtax on eligible sales transactions for Transportation-related projects. However, at least 20% of the Surtax Proceeds received by the County must be distributed to municipalities incorporated as of November 5, 2002, on a pro-rata basis using population statistics. The Surtax Program is administered by the Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust (CITT), a group comprised of 15 members appointed by the Board of County Commissioners, County Mayor, and Miami-Dade League of Cities.

Pursuant to the Interlocal Agreement, the City of Sunny Isles Beach (the City) must annually continue the same level of General Fund support for Transportation projects appropriated in its Fiscal Year (FY) 2002 Budget (Maintenance of Effort), which totaled \$129,926 (Table I). Surtax monies may be used to develop, construct, equip, maintain, operate, or expand County-wide bus systems, fixed guideway rapid transit systems, roads and bridges, as well as secure such bonds or pay debt service. Further, the City must apply at least 20% of the Surtax Proceeds to Transit-related projects, such as circulator buses, bus shelters, bus pullout bays, or other related infrastructure. *CITT Resolution No. 09-055*, adopted July 30, 2009, allows for the rollover of unspent Surtax funds for up to five years, provided the municipality's Five-Year Transportation Plan demonstrates how the funds will be used. Additionally, *CITT Resolution No. 15-027*, adopted May 20, 2015, allows for carryover credits in the event amounts expended are in excess of annual Surtax allocations. See Schedule I for summary financial information.

Audit Report – Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review – City of Sunny Isles Beach Page 2

SUMMARY RESULTS

For the eight years ended September 30, 2016, the City received \$5.7 million in Surtax Proceeds and claimed Transit and Transportation-related expenditures totaling \$6.1 million (Table I and Schedule II). After adjusting claimed expenditures for the Maintenance of Effort (MOE) and other minor disallowances, the City has \$188,756 in unspent Transportation-related Surtax Proceeds as of September 30, 2016 (Schedule III).

Table I Surtax Statistics

			Fi	scal Year End	led September	30,			
Description	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	All Years
Maintenance of Effort (MOE)	\$ 129,926	<u>\$ 129,926</u>	\$ 129,926	\$ 129,926	\$ 129,926	\$ 129,926	\$ 129,926	\$ 129,926	\$ 1,039,408
Surtax Proceeds (Schedule IV)	\$ 547,355	\$ 593,184	\$ 613,819	\$ 706,920	\$ 752,852	\$ 795,768	\$ 834,090	\$ 869,990	\$ 5,713,978
Claimed Expenditures (Schedule II):	1								
Transit	\$ 435,022	\$ 555,911	\$ 648,836	\$ 574,313	\$ 674,617	\$ 562,178	\$ 563,719	\$ 782,562	\$ 4,797,158
Transportation	174,183	136,399	127,481	348,071	112,602	198,135	186,695	47,586	1,331,152
	\$ 609,205	\$ 692,310	\$ 776,317	\$ 922,384	\$ 787,219	\$ 760,313	\$ 750,414	\$ 830,148	\$ 6,128,310
Unspent Transportation-Related Surtax Proceeds 1	<u>s</u> -	<u>s -</u>	<u>s</u> -	<u>s -</u>	<u>s</u> -	<u>s</u> -	\$ 18,988	\$ 188,756	
Key Account Balances (Schedule I):1,2									
Cash and Cash Equivalents				\$ 110,480		\$ 156,396	\$ 388,853	\$ 729,131	-x
Fund Balance				\$ 204,624	\$ 77,424	\$ 377,648	\$ 932,749	\$ 1,211,722	

Source: OCITT, and City Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports and General Ledgers

These and other findings are more fully discussed in the remainder of this document. We appreciate the courtesies and assistance extended to our staff during the audit process. A copy of this Report has been submitted to the City, with a written response requested within 30 days in accordance with *County Administrative Order No. 3-7*. Please contact Jacqueline Williams, Audit Manager, at (786) 469-5900, if you have any questions.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Use of Surtax Proceeds

The City claimed \$4.8 million in Transit expenditures that exceeded its 20% minimum spending threshold of \$1.1 million. These expenditures were for the operation of the *SIBshuttle* along three routes daily, excluding major holidays, at varying times from 7:45 am to 7:50 pm. The average combined monthly ridership is 12,542, or 151,000 annually (Table II).

As of October 31, 2016, the fleet was comprised of six shuttle buses, including two acquired through the County with American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) funds (Table III). Weekly, three of the six buses are placed in service on a rotational basis. In FY 2014, the City realized \$37,561 from the sale of three buses that had been in service approximately ten years.

¹ As of September 30th.

² Fund was created in FY 2012 to record certain Surtax Program expenditures.

Audit Report – Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review – City of Sunny Isles Beach Page 3

Table II SIBshuttle Ridership

			DIDSH	ume Mu	dine io			
			For the F	iscal Year	Ended Sept	ember 30,		
Month	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
October	8,315	11,170	12,949	13,779	13,532	15,239	15,354	14,164
November	7,834	9,711	11,996	15,583	13,088	13,695	12,910	13,573
December	8,969	10,544	12,293	13,410	12,726	13,316	14,345	13,227
January	9,865	10,322	12,560	15,247	13,580	14,924	15,188	13,516
February	10,048	9,895	12,903	14,717	13,357	14,996	14,877	13,508
March	10,522	11,722	14,965	16,012	13,398	15,209	15,741	13,433
April	9,082	11,146	13,899	13,198	13,011	15,085	14,259	11,693
May	9,126	12,142	13,037	14,878	13,081	14,158	13,475	11,733
June	9,350	10,870	11,984	12,531	11,291	11,859	12,328	10,682
July	9,954	11,106	12,001	11,989	11,432	12,822	12,445	10,663
August	9,601	12,929	13,463	13,146	13,497	13,737	12,647	11,206
September	9,751	11,766	_13,606	10,459	12,588	_13,115	12,830	_11,199
	112,417	133,323	155,656	164,949	154,581	168,155	166,399	148,597

Source: City Bus Ridership Reports

To meet its Transportation spending targets, the City claimed \$1.3 million primarily for the Pedestrian/Vehicular Bridge project and street lighting costs. After adjusting claimed amounts for the MOE, proceeds from bus sales, and minor disallowances, the City had \$188,756 in unspent Transportation Surtax Proceeds as of September 30, 2016 (Schedule III).

Table III
City Bus Fleet as of October 31, 2016

	CAU, E	us ricet as or	OCCOBEL	01, 2010	,	
Bus Number	Description	Dimensions/ Passenger Capacity	Cost	Mileage In No. of Miles 1	nformation As of	No. of Years In Service
		Сарастту	Cost	Milles	AS 01	Service
Inactive,	and Pending Auction				August	
0620	2006 Ford E450	23'/21 passengers	\$ 79,450	127,044	05/15/15	10
Active/In	ı-Service					
0830	2007 Ford E450	23'/21 passengers	75,411	133,205	10/23/16	9
1030	2010 Chevrolet C5550	33'/28 passengers	93,289	144,617	10/31/16	7
1224	2012 Ford F550	33'/28 passengers	101,398 ²	70,871	10/31/16	4
1225	2012 Ford F550	33'/28 passengers	101,398 ²	82,423	10/31/16	4
1226	2012 Ford F550	33'/28 passengers	108,884	90,953	10/31/16	4
1609	2016 Glaval Legacy	35'/32 passengers	167,426	10,911	10/31/16	1

Source: City Invoices and AMS Observations

Recommendation

Pursuant to CITT Resolution No. 09-055, the City should submit a revised Five-Year Transportation Plan to demonstrate how the \$188,756 will be used.

¹ Pursuant to FTA guidelines, the average useful life for these buses is 7 or 10 years, or 200,000 or 350,000 miles, respectively.

² Acquired through an Interlocal Agreement with the County.

Audit Report – Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review – City of Sunny Isles Beach Page 4

Accounting for Surtax-Related Expenditures

Documents supporting claimed expenditures (e.g., invoices) did not specify the funding source.

Recommendation

The City should specify the funding source to enhance accountability.

Shuttle Bus Maintenance Vendor

From October 2008 through June 2012, contractor John Churchill was used by the City to maintain the *SIBshuttle* bus fleet, for an annual average fee of \$15,000, without a formal contract. It was not until July 2012 that Mr. Churchill was contracted to provide heating and air-conditioning services, and The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Co. for other maintenance services, in amounts not to exceed \$30,000 and \$60,000, respectively. The Agreement with John Churchill was terminated in July 2016.

Recommendation

Prospectively, the City should endeavor to competitively solicit vendors, and formalize Professional Service Agreements in writing.

Reporting Requirements

The City submitted most of the required reports, albeit some were received late. In addition, two Annual Certification letters (FYs 2009 and 2010) and the 3rd Quarterly Report for FY 2009 were unavailable for review. Further, Quarterly Reports did not always agree to the General Ledger.

Recommendation

Prospectively, the City should submit Reports timely and accurately.

CJ:ag

Attachments

c: Honorable Harvey A. Ruvin, Clerk of the Courts
Abigail Price-Williams, County Attorney
Edward Marquez, Deputy Mayor
Alina T. Hudak, Deputy Mayor
Jennifer Moon, Director, Office of Management and Budget
Neil R. Singh, Acting Commission Auditor
Christopher J. Russo, City Manager, City of Sunny Isles Beach

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review - City of Sunny Isles Beach Street Maintenance and Construction Fund $^{\rm 1}$

		Fiscal Ye	ar Ended Septe	mber 30,	
Description	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
В	alance Sheets				
Assets:					
Cash and Cash Equivalents	\$ 110,480	\$ 19,276	\$ 156,396	\$ 388,853	\$ 729,131
Investments Passingles Note	13,720	22,757	153,724	463,565	379,229
Receivables, Net Interest Receivable	177,781	188,964	192,750	213,420	301,028
Inventory	77 1,717	120 3,722	800 2,514	1,980 3,720	1,246
Total Assets	\$ 303,775	\$ 234,839	\$ 506,184	\$ 1,071,538	\$ 1,410,634
Liabilities, Deferred Inflows of Resources, and Fund Balance:				4 1,111,000	4 2,123,001
Liabilities:					
Accounts Payable	\$ 21,315	\$ 68,422	\$ 43,652	\$ 34,336	\$ 29,494
Accrued Liabilities	22,071	24,352	26,867	35,711	30,780
Deferred Revenues	55,765	-	-	, , ,	_
Total Liabilities	99,151	92,774	70,519	70,047	60,274
Deferred Inflows of Resources	_	64,641	58,017	68,742	138,638
BECONTROLLO BERNELLO BE ARRESTED A CONTROL AND THE ARREST					
Fund Balance:		2			
Nonspendable Inventory Restricted for Transportation	1,717	3,722	2,514	3,720	1,246
Assigned to Subsequent Year's Budget	202,907	72 702	375,134	929,029	1,210,476
Total Fund Balance	204,624	73,702	377,648	932,749	1,211,722
Total Liabilities and Fund Balance	\$ 303,775	\$ 234,839	\$ 506,184	\$ 1,071,538	\$ 1,410,634
Statements of Revenues, Exp	enditures and C	hanges in Fund	Balance		
Revenues:					
Intergovernmental:					
Surtax Proceeds	\$ 699,469	\$ 744,952	\$ 792,983	\$ 831,491	\$ 803,426
Local Option Gas Tax State Revenue Sharing	212,475 103,256	208,915	213,564 123,728	222,474 131,692	220,108
Miscellaneous	103,236	114,651	623	(623)	132,685 697
Licenses and Permits	-	_	023	7,300	23,656
Investment Income (Loss)	280	(459)	233	10,203	15,242
	1,015,480	1,068,059	1,131,131	1,202,537	1,195,814
Expenditures:		- VI			
Transportation	1,110,020	1,431,878	1,537,928	1,521,925	1,570,058
Capital Outlay	27,176	156,651	14,508	6,615	190,113
a a constant of the constant o	1,137,196	1,588,529	1,552,436	1,528,540	1,760,171
Deficiency of Revenues over Expenditures	(121,716)	(520,470)	(421,305)	(326,003)	(564,357)
Other Financing Sources:					
Transfers-In	326,340	393,270	721,529	881,104	843,330
Net Change in Fund Balance	204,624	(127,200)	300,224	555,101	278,973
Fund Balance, Beginning of Year	_	204,624	77,424	377,648	932,749
Fund Balance, End of Year	\$ 204,624	\$ 77,424	\$ 377,648	\$ 932,749	\$ 1,211,722
Source: City of Sunny Isles Reach Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports on	ļ				

Source: City of Sunny Isles Beach Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports and General Ledgers

These Financial Statements are not complete without the accompanying Independent Auditor's Report and Notes.

¹ The Street Maintenance and Construction Fund was created in Fiscal Year 2012, and combines Surtax Proceeds, Local Option Gas Tax, State Revenue Sharing, and Other Revenues.

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review - City of Sunny Isles Beach Summary of Claimed Expenditures, As Adjusted

				Fiscal Year Ended September 30,	d September 30,				
Description	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	All Years
Transit Expenditures:	307 084	387 807	393 940	339 738	366.076	\$ 380,756	\$ 378,224	\$ 408,050	\$ 2,956,675
Fersonnel Cost	52,225				48,974	40,040	68,527	1351	516,156
Shuttle bus Maintenance and Acpans	42,391	52.924	65,840	78,758	76,658	74,343	56,443	43,624	490,981
Gasoline Gold March 20	Í	1	93 289		108,884	ì	•	167,426	369,599
Furchase of Snuttle Dus	21 860	30 908	30,685	26,232	35,540	36,470	40,485	43,207	265,387
Administration Expense	4 077	6.330	6,873	13,547	3,290	7,234	10,180	8,648	60,179
Tires Transfer of the Property		2 500	2,500	2.576	19,159	4,866	1	2,705	34,306
Bus Shelter Maintenance and repairs	9	2006	· · ·	608 6	15,001	2,739	1,990	ı	29,539
Shuttle Bus Equipment	5200		,	7.550		4.549	2,990	1,800	26,864
Promotions and Printing	212,6	9069	•	1 331	958	4,410	3,478	3,325	22,217
Uniforms and Accessories	2,300	0,203		-	'	6,771	1	5,377	16,719
Shuttle Bus Insurance	•	1/0,4		D: O	•		1 027	1.384	2,411
Education and Training	1	' 0	r ·	.)	77		375	5,665	6,125
Other		0			100	000 100	012 673	197 567	A 707 158
Total Claimed Transit Expenditures	435,022	555,911	648,836	574,313	674,617	262,178	503,719	105,302	4,171,100
Less AMS Adjustments:						20			
Proceeds from the Sale of Shuttle Buses	1	1	10	31	•	(37,561)	ī		(37,561)
Unsupported Charges:	1								
Promotions	(6,576)	•	1	î	ī	*	•	1	(6,576)
Shuttle Bus Maintenance and Renairs	1		(1,100)	•	Ĭ			3	(1,100)
Tires	(286)	11	1	'	•	Ľ	3)	1	(286)
Administrative Cost in Excess of 5% Maximim Allowance	` '	(1,249)	ì	i	1	1	1	1	(1,249)
Total Claimed Turneit Evanditures As Adjusted	\$ 428 160	\$ 554,662	\$ 647.736	\$ 574,313	\$ 674,617	\$ 524,617	\$ 563,719	\$ 782,562	\$ 4,750,386
1 ofat Claimed Transit Expenditures, As Aujusted									
Transportation Expenditures: 2	o c			701 371	77 150	136 000	36 939	,	571.090
Pedestrian/Vehicular Bridge at North Bay Road	059'6/	•	•	116,167	001,12	200,001	11,050	00 450	001 110
Street Lighting 1	20,203	16,539	42,481	39,333	38,142	40,581	41,052	39,438	100 000
Atlantic Isles Project - Atlantic Avenue Street Improvements	<u>.</u>	20,000	50,000	1	1	1	1 000 001	ti s	100,000
174th Street Drainage	1	1	•	ì	ī		100,000		59,000
Addition of Street Signage - Collins Avenue	9,255	50,000	1	•	1 00000	i)	I.S	•	007,00
182nd Street, 183rd Street, and Collins Avenue Improvements	1	1	•	17,367	40,352	1	•	1	30,000
Heritage Park and Garage Roadway Entrance	***	ì	30,000	•	' 000	. 00 61	102.0	8 1 2 8	37,392
Street Maintenance and Repairs	1	,	•		6,938	13,002	6,704	0,120	205,15
Collins Avenue Streetscape	20,000	•	•		•	•		•	20,000
Atlantic Isle Roadway Improvements	20,000	- 0000	ı	r			•	,	19.860
182nd Street and Collins Avenue Traffic Signal	14 005	19,800		. ,	' '		21	•	14,095
172nd Street Roadway Improvements	14,095			,	•		•	•	11,000
Professional Services	11,000		' '		1	7.952	in in	1	7,952
Collins Avenue Crosswalk Improvements		. 1	5.000		Ļ		•	•	5,000
North Bay Drainage - 1/900 Inoin Bay Noau	174 102	126 200	127.481	348 071	112 602	198 135	186.695	47,586	1,331,152
Total Claimed Transportation Expenditures	1/4,103	666,061	101,101	1000	2000				
Less AMS Adjustments:	(000)	1	,		ļ	•	1	1	(11,000)
Ineligible Crossing Guard Services	(000,11)								d
Unsupported Charges:	1	(646)			3	1	•	1	(646)
Street Lighting	I.	(144)	1	•	•	'	1		(144)
	(11,000)	(06L)	•	•	1	1		1	(11,790)
Total Claimed Transportation Expenditures, As Adjusted	\$ 163,183	\$ 135,609	\$ 127,481	\$ 348,071	\$ 112,602	\$ 198,135	\$ 186,695	\$ 47,586	\$ 1,319,362
Carrest City of Cumry Islan Boach (City) General I advant and Commishensive A	ehensive Annual Financial Reports	rts							

Source: City of Sunny Isles Beach (City) General Ledgers and Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports

¹ For Fiscal Years (FYs) 2009 through 2011, expenditures were recorded in the General Fund and afterwards in the Street Maintenance and Construction Fund.

² Expenditures are from the General Capital Projects Fund except as noted.

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review - City of Sunny Isles Beach Surtax Proceeds Usage Analysis

					Fiscal	Year Ende	Fiscal Year Ended September 30,	r 30,						
Description	2009	2010	0	2011	2	2012	2013		2014	7(2015	2016		All Years
Surtax Proceeds (Schedule IV) 1	\$ 547,355	.65 \$	593,184	\$ 613,819	69	706,920	\$ 752,852	8	795,768	8	834,090	\$ 869,990	\$ 066	5,713,978
Surtax Uses:	\$ 428,160	\$ 55.	554,662	\$ 647,736	€9	574,313	\$ 674,617	2	524,617	69	563,719	\$ 782,562	562 \$	4,750,386
Engible 1 ransit Expenditures (Sonedule 11) Less Amounts Used to Meet the Maintenance of Effort (MOE) Requirement	•		'	(2,445)		1	(17,324)	4)	1		1		_	(102,109)
Expenditures Available for Surtax Use	\$ 428,160	\$ 55.	554,662	\$ 645,291	8	574,313	\$ 657,293	8	524,617	S	563,719	\$ 700,222	222 \$	4,648,277
Eligible Transportation Expenditures (Schedule II)	\$ 163,183	\$ 13	135,609	\$ 127,481	69	348,071	\$ 112,602	2	198,135	69	186,695	\$ 47,	47,586 \$	1,
Transit Expenditures Applied to Meet the MOE	(129,926)	(12	- (129,926)	2,445 (129,926)		(129,926)	17,324 (129,926)	4 6	- (129,926)	\odot	-(129,926)	82, (129,	82,340 129,926)	102,109 (1,039,408)
Expenditures Available for Surtax Use	\$ 33,257	S	5,683	\$	8	218,145	49	∞	68,209	8	56,769	69	<u>ه</u>	382,063
AMS Analysis:														
Transit-Related Expenditures:					6	212.72			717 703	6	662 710	CCC 00L 3	222	777 879 7
Expenditures Available for Surfax Use	\$ 428,160 (109,471)	\$ = 5	354,662 3	\$ 645,291 (122,764)	A	(141,384)	(150,570)	e 0 0	(159,154)	Ŭ	(166,818)	·	$\overline{}$	(1,142,796)
Excess Expenditures	\$ 318,689	\$ 43		\$ 522,527	69	432,929	\$ 506,723	8	365,463	69	396,901	\$ 526,224	224	3,505,481
Analysis of Excess Expenditures Rollover Amounts:						ĺ			t	6	5	6	6	404 00
Beginning Carry-Forward Balance, As Restated (Schedule III-A)	\$ (494,882)	\$ (40	(408,944)	\$ (376,105)	64)	(407,577)	\$ (493,115)	2)	(355,756)	A	(194,614)	A	A -	(494,882)
Excess Expenditures Applied	(318,689)	(43	(436,025)	(522,527)	_	(432,929)	(506,723)	3)	(365,463)	<u>.</u>	(396,901)	(526,	(526,224)	(3,505,481)
Excess Expenditures Applied to Reduce Unspent Transportation-Related Surtax Proceeds	- 1				6	347,391	602,282	_	568,405	6	515,195	970	\$ 220,224	4,000,303
Remaining Carry-Forward Credit	\$ (408,944)	\$ (37	(376,105)	\$ (407,577)	A	(495,115)	3 (397,95)	<u>al</u>	(194,014)	9	1	9	• -	
Transportation-Related Expenditures: Expenditures Available for Surtax Use	\$ 33,257	€9	5,683	\$	€9	218,145	8	69	68,209	S	56,769	S	-	382,063
Less Remaining 80% Amount ²	(437,884)	(47	(474,547)	(491,055)		(565,536)	(602,282)	[5]	(636,614)		(667,272)	(695	(695,992)	(4,571,182)
Increase In Unspent Funds	(404,627)	(46	(468,864)	(491,055)		(347,391)	(602,282)	 	(568,405)	<u> </u>	(610,503)	(695,992)	992)	(4,189,119)
Analysis of Unspent Rollover:								•		•			_	
Beginning Balance, As Restated (Schedule III-A)	· ••	69		•	A		,		1 0	A	1 00	0 10	00,700	1 100 110
Increase In Unspent Amounts	404,627	46	468,864	491,055		347,391	602,282	7	568,405		610,503	660	766,060	4,189,11
Excess Transit Expenditures Applied	(404,627)	(46	(468,864)	(491,055)		(347,391)	(602,282)	[]	(568,405)		591,515)			4,
Remaining Unspent Amount	-	69	1	\$	↔	-	8	ا _د ی		60	18,988	\$ 188	188,756	188,756

Amounts differ from those reported by the City of Sunny Isles Beach due to timing differences.

At Jeast 20% of the Surtax Proceeds must be used on Transit-related projects, such as circulator buses, and the remaining funds (80%) are earmarked for eligible Transportation projects.

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review - City of Sunny Isles Beach Surtax Proceeds Usage Analysis, as Restated $^{\rm 1}$

			, , ,											
					Fiscal	Year End	ed Se	Fiscal Year Ended September 30,						
Description	2(2003	2	2004		2005		2006	7(2007	2	2008	All Years	S
Surtax Proceeds (Schedule IV)	\$	293,299	8	449,411	8	486,866	€9	548,772	89	555,020	643	582,250	\$ 2,915,618	518
Surtax Uses: Eligible Transit Expenditures ²	↔	143,818	↔	497,739	↔	184,687	8	422,668	S	455,817	€9	470,263	\$ 2,174,992	992
Eligible Transportation Expenditures ² Less Maintenance of Effort	\$	147,944	8	348,321 (129,926)	69	557,126 (129,926)	€9	258,325 (129,926)	*	339,989	∞	363,359	\$ 2,015,064 (779,556)	064 556)
Expenditures Available for Surtax Use	€	18,018	69	218,395	69	427,200	8	128,399	89	210,063	8	233,433	\$ 1,235,508	208
AMS Analysis: Transit-Related Expenditures:														
Expenditures Available for Surtax Use I ess 20% Minimum Amount 3	€9	143,818 (58,660)	\$	497,739 (89,882)	€9	184,687 (97,373)	∽	422,668 (109,754)	\$	455,817 (111,004)	<u>چ</u>	470,263 (116,450)	\$ 2,174,992 (583,123)	992
Excess Expenditures	89	85,158	8	407,857	89	87,314	8	312,914	8	344,813	8	353,813	\$ 1,591,869	698
Analysis of Excess Expenditures Rollover Amounts:			4			0		9	•	000		000	6	
Beginning Balance	6	- (85 158)	.	- (407 857)	A	(135,260)	/	(312,914)	A	(344.813)	A .	(353,813)	- (1,591,869)	(698
Excess Experimentes Applied Excess Expenditures Applied to Reduce Unspent Transportation-Related Surfax Proceeds		85,158		272,597				272,912		233,953		232,367	1,096,987	786
Remaining Carry-Forward Credit	8	'	8	(135,260)	8	(222,574)	8	(262,576)	\$	(373,436)	8	(494,882)	\$ (494,882)	882)
Transportation-Related Expenditures:					i i			,			•	0		
Expenditures Available for Surtax Use	<u>\$</u>	18,018	<u>ده</u>	218,395	69	427,200 (389,493)	9	128,399 (439,018)		210,063 (444,016)		(465,800)	\$ 1,235,508 (2,332,495)	308 495)
(Increase) Decrease in Unspent Amounts	S	(216,621)	8	(141,134)	€	37,707	8	(310,619)	\$	(233,953)	8	(232,367)	\$ (1,096,987)	(186
Analysis of Unspent Rollover:			2		1						,		+	
Beginning Balance	\$	1	69	131,463	€9	1	⇔	(37,707)	69	ı	50	I	-	1
Increase (Decrease) In Unspent Amounts Excess Transit Expenditures Amlied		216,621 (85,158)		141,134 (272,597)		(37,707)		310,619 (272,912)		233,953 (233,953)	J	232,367 (232,367)	1,096,987 $(1,096,987)$	987 987)
Remaining Unspent Amount	€	131,463	69		8	(37,707)	8	1	8		€9	1	8	1
														1

Amounts have been restated to reflect the impact of CHT Resolution Nos. 09-055 and 15-027, that allows for the rollover of unspent Surtax funds and carry-forward credits, respectively.

See the September 10, 2009 Audit Report for additional details.

At least 20% of the Surtax Proceeds must be used on Transit-related projects, such as circulator buses, and the remaining funds (80%) are earmarked for eligible Transportation projects.

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review Summary of Payments to Municipalities

	CONTRACTOR OF STREET					<u> </u>	Fiscal Year Ended September 30.	d September 30.							
Municipality	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	All Years
City of Mismi	\$ 6905410	\$ 10.580.915	\$ 11 208 930	\$ 12.562.541	\$ 12,855,629	\$ 12,574,719	\$ 11,545,439	\$ 11,946,673	\$ 13,113,576	\$ 13,555,331	\$ 14,564,114	\$ 15,424,405	\$ 16,414,208	\$ 16,889,133	\$ 180,141,023
City of Hialeah			7,014,990		7,656,151	7,336,976	6,672,306	6,709,589	7,117,975	7,623,497	8,118,432	8,457,199	8,983,772	9,243,159	103,762,933
City of Miami Beach	1 686 079	2.583,517	2,719,756	3,029,839	3,108,056	2,960,734	2,736,361	2,765,507	2,916,205	2,978,728	3,166,271	3,351,080	3,552,358	3,670,335	41,224,826
City of North Mismi	1 136 965	1.742.129	1,805,505	1,989,253	2,004,095	1,919,328	1,759,840	1,755,291	1,836,714	1,994,866	2,107,503	2,212,494	2,328,969	2,454,241	27,047,193
City of Miami Gardens 2		1	1	1	1		ï	ï	E	10,352,937	3,837,951	3,985,238	4,199,539	4,336,722	26,712,387
City of Homestead	621.791	952,745	1,051,671	1,208,129	1,275,853	1,387,011	1,681,886	1,747,262	1,809,949	2,053,440	2,204,159	2,354,015	2,519,902	2,669,792	23,537,605
City of Coral Gables	810,009	1,241,148	1,298,953	1,467,752	1,480,710	1,426,754	1,302,297	1,346,817	1,429,343	1,587,452	1,685,507	1,781,041	1,897,394	1,955,854	20,711,031
City of North Miami Beach	799,300	1,224,740	1,267,423	1,402,019	1,366,735	1,307,355	1,195,378	1,202,159	1,260,998	1,409,058	1,493,737	1,566,354	1,659,574	1,733,203	18,888,033
City of Aventura	495,408	759,096	818,788	933,612	947,021	946,296	887,089	912,935	977,774	1,213,562	1,280,248	1,385,071	1,436,028	1,494,036	14,486,964
Town of Miami Lakes	460,331	705,348	737,093	822,002	822,114	876,926	760,175	774,921	810,925	996,347	1,052,533	1,095,293	1,172,205	1,209,319	12,295,532
City of Doral	,		1	ı.		1	,	ı	ı	3,642,653	1,667,049	1,767,800	1,925,900	2,120,606	11,124,008
Village of Palmetto Bay	459,612	704,246	745,086	824,252	823,908	807,842	734,476	740,194	789,514	794,405	841,373	879,379	930,008	952,951	11,027,246
Town of Cutler Bay 2.3	1		ı	1	ı	1	1		1	3,886,873	1,453,608	1,541,361	1,643,660	1,721,858	10,247,360
City of Hialeah Gardens	373,801	572,763	604,331	676,565	681,956	657,921	598,273	615,769	659,652	737,631	780,808	816,410	859,975	904,713	9,540,568
City of Sunny Isles Beach	293,299	449,411	486,866	548,772	555,020	582,250	547,355	593,184	613,819	706,920	752,852	795,768	834,090	869,990	8,629,596
Village of Pinecrest	361,540	553,977	579,684	639,364	646,631	627,523	14,305	572,099	612,279	618,387	1,205,816	686,122	723,235	737,876	8,578,838
City of Opa-locka	291,102	446,045	468,652	533,416	513,020	497,615	448,435	445,408	480,123	516,448	552,018	580,600	556,122	90,323	6,419,327
City of Miami Springs	259,738	397,985	412,534	456,196	459,353	440,937	398,334	398,681	421,632	468,600	496,146	522,095	550,052	562,418	6,244,701
City of Sweetwater 1	270,238	414,075	429,218	472,215	477,595	458,867	418,273	419,090	350,048	368,080	390,842	326,534	275,281	273,778	5,344,134
City of South Miami	203,889	312,415	323,655	360,476	351,494	338,279	308,347	328,868	357,423	395,573	443,069	504,946	538,750	546,219	5,313,403
Village of Key Biscayne	202,733	310,644	333,638	369,378	379,639	368,354	333,808	339,806	358,459	418,886	443,069	461,282	489,679	502,197	5,311,572
Miami Shores Village	197.655	302,860	313,826	346,278	348,437	335,963	301,400	313,310	340,930	345,317	368,810	384,663	408,970	419,557	4,727,976
City of Florida City	153.748	235,582	254,464	288,454	291,983	295,447	272,056	299,755	320,951	381,591	419,450	440,752	477,906	498,385	4,630,524
North Bay Village	126,762	194,231	198,770	218,913	215,921	186,169	167,474	200,385	214,742	242,190	263,374	279,848	299,797	314,789	3,123,365
City of West Miami	113,307	173,613	185,212	202,961	194,190	184,561	167,123	167,329	180,093	202,418	214,600	224,057	235,786	241,053	2,686,303
Town of Surfside	95,908	146,959	157,799	184,160	144,185	223,419	168,610	170,243	180,473	194,919	206,033	214,832	226,558	229,428	2,543,526
Town of Bay Harbor Islands	686'96	148,613	155,936	172,145	173,190	167,339	150,306	151,009	160,052	190,982	201,912	214,053	227,105	231,953	2,441,584
Village of Biscayne Park	62,045	95,070	104,750	117,666	110,586	106,676	97,167	96,222	100,460	103,670	110,094	115,264	122,506	125,900	1,468,076
Bal Harbour Village	62,707	96,085	99,550	112,832	105,834	95,526	89,285	91,016	104,292	85,278	29,68	110,690	113,983	114,472	1,377,217
Village of Virginia Gardens	44,592	68,325	70,576	976,77	78,619	76,184	68,729	67,579	71,151	80,594	85,654	89,044	94,354	96,229	1,069,609
Village of El Portal 1	47,795	73,232	76,045	84,400	84,367	82,000	73,663	73,579	77,875	78,896	83,900	87,815	88,880	6,467	1,018,914
Town of Medlev	21,186	32,464	33,963	37,170	37,616	41,385	33,052	33,111	35,277	28,436	29,889	31,913	33,823	34,442	463,727
Town of Golden Beach	17,511	26,830	27,952	32,999	24,732	7,016	37,226	27,846	29,686	31,187	33,042	34,366	35,427	36,766	402,586
Indian Creek Village ⁵	625	955	931	1,093	1	1	1	1	1					1 000	
	\$ 21,054,793	\$ 32,261,501	\$ 33,986,547	\$ 37,903,517	\$ 38,214,640	\$ 37,317,372	\$ 33,968,468	\$ 35,311,637	\$ 37,732,390	\$ 58,285,152	\$ 50,643,530	\$ 52,721,784	\$ 55,855,796	\$ 57,288,164	\$ 582,545,291
Oct. Cot. Cit. Cit. and Arcenting Management	Signat Transmortation	'm Trust (OCITT) a	nd the County's Fins	Accounting A	Annagement Inform	Information System									

Source: Office of the Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust (OCITT) and the County's Financial Accounting Management Information System

1 Amounts are not of withholdings of \$76,533 from the Tive of Miami Lakes, \$983,000 from the City of Sweetwater, \$21,058 from the Town of Golden Beach, \$658,577 from the City of Opa-locka, \$276,000 from the City of Miami, and \$84,069 from the Willage of El Portal, due to specific instances of noncompliance.

2 Pursuant to the respective Interiocal and/or Settlement Agreements, these Municipalities, which were incorporated after November 2002, are receiving a share of the County's Surfax Proceeds consistent with the other Municipal informs.

As per OCITT, Municipality received \$3,000 in excess of amounts due for Fiscal Year (FY) 2012, which was corrected in FY 2013.

⁴ Amount in 2009 is net of \$551,589 returned by the Village of Pinecrest for their unspent Transit portion of funding as of September 30, 2007. In FY 2013, OCITT returned the monies to the Village.
⁵ A total of \$22,648 has been withheld from Indian Creek Village, at their request, since FY 2007.

Charter County Transportation System Surtax Review – City of Sunny Isles Beach (City) Status of Prior Audit Findings ¹

		0	
Finding	Recommendation	Auditee Response	Current Status
General Fund Support			
The City reported \$92,000 as its Maintenance of Effort (MOE), however, we identified an additional \$37,926 related to the existing Community Shuttle Bus operation, as well as street lighting projects.	Require the City to certify the corrected MOE of \$129,926 within 30 days.	The City will certify the correct MOE.	Resolved The City certified the correct MOE amount of \$129,926.
Use of Surtax Proceeds			
The City was unable to expend \$139,075 in Surtax Proceeds.	Recapture the \$139,075 or allow rollover in subsequent periods in accordance with recently approved Citizens' Independent Transportation Trust (CITT) guidelines.	CITT Resolution No. 09-055 will allow us to roll over these funds and avoid any recapture.	Resolved After applying the changes permitted pursuant to CITT Resolution Nos. 09-055 and 15-027, the previously reported unspent amount was fully eliminated as of September 30, 2008.
Certification and Reporting Requirements	nts		
The City could not provide our auditors certain annual reports. Moreover, the Fiscal Year 2008 Certification letter omitted the required affirmation that Transit Surtax funds had been used in accordance with the Interlocal Agreement, as Amended.	Prospectively, the City should submit all required reports to OCITT.	It was our understanding that submittal of the approved budget, transportation plan, and a copy of the annual independent audit was all that was required.	Partially Resolved The City submitted most of the required reports, although some were received late. See Page 4 of the Audit Report.
Signage			
The City had no evidence of required signage on the existing Community Shuttle Buses.	Instruct the City to post the signage as required.	We will provide the signage once a sample is provided.	<u>Resolved</u>

¹ For the full text, see the Audit Report dated September 10, 2009 and the City's September 25, 2009 Response.