MIAMI-DADE COUNTY
FINAL OFFICIAL MINUTES
Compensation and Benefits Review Ad Hoc Committee (CBRAHC)

Board of County Commissioners
Stephen P. Clark Government Center
3rd Floor Conference Room
111 N.W. First Street
Miami, Florida 33128

May 1, 2012
As Advertised

Harvey Ruvin, Clerk
Board of County Commissioners

Christopher Agrippa, Division Chief
Clerk of the Board Division

Alan Eisenberg, Commission Reporter
(305) 375-2510

CLERKS SUMMARY AND OFFICIAL MINUTES
SUNSHINE MEETING
COMPENSATION AND BENEFITS REVIEW AD HOC COMMITTEE
MAY 1, 2012

The Compensation and Benefits Review Ad Hoc Committee (CBRC) convened in a Sunshine Meeting in the 3rd floor Conference Room of the Stephen P. Clark Government Center (SPCGC) at 1:08 p.m. County Commissioners Esteban Bovo, Jr., Jose "Pepe" Diaz, Barbara J. Jordan and Jean Monestime were present. Also present were Deputy Mayor Ed Marquez; Assistant County Attorney Lee Kraftchick; Internal Services Department Director Lester Sola, Assistant Director Mary Lou Rizzo, Labor Management Specialist Karen Toledo, Compensation Manager Eneldo Hernandez; Commission Auditor Charles Anderson, Districts 1, 2, 12 and 13 staff members; and Deputy Clerk Alan Eisenberg.

CBRC Chairwoman Jordan welcomed commissioners, staff and guests to today's (5/01) meeting. She explained that she put on the record the need to address the County's pay plan at last year's budget hearing and requested that Chairman Martinez appoint an ad hoc committee. Commissioner Jordan noted that she along with Commissioners Bovo, Diaz, and Monestime were appointed to that Committee pursuant to the Chairman's memorandum. She said her goal for today's (5/01) meeting was primarily to establish a regular meeting schedule, noting it was her recommendation the CBRC meet weekly for two hours.

Commissioner Diaz suggested meeting on Tuesdays and Thursdays.

Commissioner Bovo inquired whether a date certain was established for the CBRC to report back to the Board of County Commissioners (BCC).

Chairwoman Jordan responded that she believed 90 days would be adequate. She noted a previous task force was formed based upon an Item sponsored by former County Commissioner Seijas and asked Internal Services Assistant Director Mary Lou Rizzo and staff to present that report at the CBRC's first meeting. Chairwoman Jordan said the task force already reviewed pay plans, the Fox Lawson study, pay supplements, and more than 2,000 classifications and recommended that this Committee develop its agenda after hearing the outcomes of the task force's report. She noted the pay plan needed to be reviewed to decide whether to recommend a salary range or steps. Commissioner Jordan asked the Assistant County Attorney to confirm the duration of current union contract terms.

Responding to Chairwoman Jordan, Assistant County Attorney Lee Kraftchick advised that union contracts were effective through 2014 with the exception of the four percent pension contributions which were open for the next two years and needed to be considered in the FY 2012-13 budgets. He said any other major changes to the pay plan would need to go through the negotiation process.

Commissioner Bovo requested that pertinent information be provided to CBRC members in advance of upcoming meetings, to avoid reviewing that information at the meeting. He committed to meeting on Tuesdays and Thursdays.

Commissioner Monestime also agreed that Tuesdays and Thursdays would be convenient to meet. He suggested that meetings be held in the mornings and be limited to two hours.

Commissioners Bovo and Diaz concurred with morning meetings.

Chairwoman Jordan expressed concern that CBRC meetings might conflict with Committee week meetings.

Staff indicated that this would not be a concern because Committee meetings were scheduled Monday through Wednesday.

Commissioner Monestime noted he would not be available from July 19th through the end of the month.

Chairwoman Jordan noted her desire to complete the CBRC work by mid-July.

Commissioner Diaz commented that commissioners had staff that could assist, address issues and brief other commissioners between CBRC meetings.

Chairwoman Jordan confirmed that weekly meetings would be held on Thursdays from 9:00 – 11:00 a.m., and bi-weekly if necessary. She noted any potential conflict with zoning meetings would be addressed as necessary. Chairwoman Jordan said she would be meeting with Ms. Rizzo and Commission Auditor Charles Anderson to review applicable materials and ensure CBRC members received those documents at least three to four days before the meetings.

In response to Commissioner Diaz' question about her vision for this Committee, Chairwoman Jordan indicated that a complete overhaul of the pay plan system, including the number of supplements and classifications was needed. She noted the current pay plan allowed employees to receive up to a five-percent annual salary increase if they received a satisfactory rating on their evaluation. Chairwoman Jordan added that unions may negotiate a three-percent increase and another one-percent increase. She said she recommended the formation of the CBRC because a nine-percent increase was unsustainable. Chairwoman Jordan noted the County would always have the same problem until the Administration addressed salary increases and the manner in which employees were paid. She presented the following two options: (1) a maximum five-percent annual salary increase for employees, while restricting departments to a two-percent increase or under; and (2) restricting union negotiations to a maximum of five-percent salary increases for employees. Chairwoman Jordan said the results of the CBRC discussions could not be implemented until current union contracts expired.

Commissioner Diaz expressed concern that commissioners were not involved in the union negotiation process until it was time for them to vote on those decisions. He noted salary caps would be a method to resolve issues. Commissioner Diaz said that administrative and legislative bodies needed to work together to identify solutions so that everyone would know what was happening ahead of time. He inquired about the timing of upcoming contract negotiations.

Pursuant to Commissioner Diaz' question, Ms. Rizzo indicated that Administration was currently negotiating additional health care contributions for contract years two and three, and proposed reopening provisions during the third year. She noted negotiations would begin in April 2014 for the successor agreements.

Commissioner Diaz inquired and Assistant County Attorney Kraftchick confirmed that the BCC was bound by existing contractual agreements with the unions and that the BCC could provide Administration with instructions about what to include in the negotiations.

In response to Commissioner Diaz' question as to whether the decisions of the BCC or those of the Administration would take precedence under a strong mayor form of government, Assistant County Attorney Kraftchick indicated that Administration had control over individual decisions; however, the BCC could establish policy guidelines about what was to be included in the union contracts.

Chairwoman Jordan noted the CBRC needed to be provided with an overview of the civil service structure and parameters as well as whether any restrictions existed to the outcomes of these discussions.

Commissioner Bovo expressed his desire that the CBRC examine the rollover of unused sick and vacation time. He noted he did not wish to take anything away from employees who had already earned it; however, he believed the rollover practice needed to be examined to consider its financial impact. Commissioner Bovo said commissioners needed to decide whether they were willing to adopt the same decisions for their staff as they did for other employees. He noted commissioners should establish policy and then could direct how Administration should negotiate union contracts taking these guidelines into consideration. This process of creating up-front expectations and guidelines would expedite the final vote, he added.

Commissioner Monestime commended Chairwoman Jordan for requesting that the CBRC be established and for agreeing to serve as its Chairwoman. He noted his agreement with Chairwoman Jordan that a better understanding of the civil service rules was needed. Commissioner Monestime said he did not support capping professional employee salaries, noting the most capable individuals were needed to assist elected officials make appropriate decisions. He noted an organization with over 2,000 pay classifications was very dysfunctional, and believed this could be streamlined.

Commissioner Diaz indicated that government was not meant to be an extremely efficient corporation; yet it was to be efficient, good and serve the people in many different ways. He noted he concurred that having more than 2,000 job classifications was excessive.

Commissioner Diaz pointed out that salary caps allowed employees to know what they could achieve in their current position. He noted community residents were angry and wanted to see that County government was a responsible entity. Commissioner Diaz said he was very proud of the hard working County employees. He noted that Miami-Dade County government was burdened with issues which needed to be addressed even though it operated very efficiently and had excellent investments when compared to other government entities. Commissioner Diaz said he looked forward to working with Chairwoman Jordan and taking advantage of her administrative expertise.

Chairwoman Jordan said she believed salary caps already existed since there was an entry level salary and a maximum salary for that pay plan. She noted an employee's salary was then frozen for five years; however, cost of living increases still applied, she added. Chairwoman Jordan said that bumping and exemption issues needed to be addressed in addition to salary ranges, salary increases, and cost of living increases.

Deputy Mayor Ed Marquez noted Administration looked forward to the outcome of the CBRC discussions. He said that BCC members would receive bi-weekly updates on union negotiations. Deputy Mayor Marquez assured the CBRC that Administration would try to implement any BCC policy directives; however, this required union negotiations and Administration would provide the BCC with the results of those negotiations. He said that the Administration supported the development of a more understandable pay plan, even though the final result may not be a merit-based compensation pay plan as used in the private sector.

Commissioner Diaz noted the ability to obtain additional designations provided pay increases in merit based pay plans. He said that he did not want to stop employee development; however, limits must be placed on financial incentives.

Chairwoman Jordan said that a firefighter receiving extra pay for having a diver designation even though he/she did not work near a beach was an example of the kind of issues needing to be reviewed. She said some difficult decisions and recommendations would be necessary.

Assistant County Attorney Kraftchick noted divers, paramedics, emergency medical technicians, air rescuers, and other specializations were examples of positions receiving five-percent salary increases.

Commissioner Bovo questioned the merit pay process noting similarities with teachers obtaining higher degrees and specializations in order to receive salary increases.

Chairwoman Jordan asked staff to schedule future meetings in a conference room on the 18th floor of the SPCGC to accommodate open and transparent discussions. She said discussions would be primarily between the four County Commissioners serving on the CBRC, members of the Administration, the previous task force members, and other members of the Commission.

Assistant County Attorney Kraftchick clarified that public input was not necessary.

Deputy Mayor Ed Marquez explained that Administration was in the middle of union negotiations and staff would do its best to provide any information to the CBRC.

There being no further business, the Compensation and Benefits Review Ad Hoc Committee was adjourned at 1:47 p.m.

Barbara J. Jordan, Chair